



Province of Alberta

The 28th Legislature  
First Session

# Alberta Hansard

Thursday, December 6, 2012

Issue 29

The Honourable Gene Zwozdesky, Speaker

## Legislative Assembly of Alberta The 28th Legislature

First Session

Zwozdesky, Hon. Gene, Edmonton-Mill Creek (PC), Speaker  
Rogers, George, Leduc-Beaumont (PC), Deputy Speaker and Chair of Committees  
Jablonski, Mary Anne, Red Deer-North (PC), Deputy Chair of Committees

Allen, Mike, Fort McMurray-Wood Buffalo (PC)  
Amery, Moe, Calgary-East (PC)  
Anderson, Rob, Airdrie (W),  
Official Opposition House Leader  
Anglin, Joe, Rimbey-Rocky Mountain House-Sundre (W)  
Barnes, Drew, Cypress-Medicine Hat (W)  
Bhardwaj, Naresh, Edmonton-Ellerslie (PC)  
Bhullar, Hon. Manmeet Singh, Calgary-Greenway (PC)  
Bikman, Gary, Cardston-Taber-Warner (W)  
Bilous, Deron, Edmonton-Beverly-Clareview (ND)  
Blakeman, Laurie, Edmonton-Centre (AL),  
Liberal Opposition House Leader  
Brown, Dr. Neil, QC, Calgary-Mackay-Nose Hill (PC)  
Calahasen, Pearl, Lesser Slave Lake (PC)  
Campbell, Hon. Robin, West Yellowhead (PC),  
Deputy Government House Leader  
Cao, Wayne C.N., Calgary-Fort (PC)  
Casey, Ron, Banff-Cochrane (PC)  
Cusanelli, Hon. Christine, Calgary-Currie (PC)  
Dallas, Hon. Cal, Red Deer-South (PC)  
DeLong, Alana, Calgary-Bow (PC)  
Denis, Hon. Jonathan, QC, Calgary-Acadia (PC),  
Deputy Government House Leader  
Donovan, Ian, Little Bow (W)  
Dorward, David C., Edmonton-Gold Bar (PC)  
Drysdale, Hon. Wayne, Grande Prairie-Wapiti (PC)  
Eggen, David, Edmonton-Calder (ND),  
New Democrat Opposition Whip  
Fawcett, Hon. Kyle, Calgary-Klein (PC)  
Fenske, Jacquie, Fort Saskatchewan-Vegreville (PC)  
Forsyth, Heather, Calgary-Fish Creek (W)  
Fox, Rodney M., Lacombe-Ponoka (W)  
Fraser, Rick, Calgary-South East (PC)  
Fritz, Yvonne, Calgary-Cross (PC)  
Goudreau, Hector G., Dunvegan-Central Peace-Notley (PC)  
Griffiths, Hon. Doug, Battle River-Wainwright (PC)  
Hale, Jason W., Strathmore-Brooks (W)  
Hancock, Hon. Dave, QC, Edmonton-Whitemud (PC),  
Government House Leader  
Hehr, Kent, Calgary-Buffalo (AL)  
Horne, Hon. Fred, Edmonton-Rutherford (PC)  
Horner, Hon. Doug, Spruce Grove-St. Albert (PC)  
Hughes, Hon. Ken, Calgary-West (PC)  
Jansen, Sandra, Calgary-North West (PC)  
Jeneroux, Matt, Edmonton-South West (PC)  
Johnson, Hon. Jeff, Athabasca-Sturgeon-Redwater (PC)  
Johnson, Linda, Calgary-Glenmore (PC)  
Kang, Darshan S., Calgary-McCall (AL),  
Liberal Opposition Whip  
Kennedy-Glans, Donna, Calgary-Varsity (PC)  
Khan, Hon. Stephen, St. Albert (PC)  
Klimchuk, Hon. Heather, Edmonton-Glenora (PC)  
Kubinec, Maureen, Barrhead-Morinville-Westlock (PC)  
Lemke, Ken, Stony Plain (PC)  
Leskiw, Genia, Bonnyville-Cold Lake (PC)  
Luan, Jason, Calgary-Hawkwood (PC)  
Lukaszuk, Hon. Thomas A., Edmonton-Castle Downs (PC)  
Mason, Brian, Edmonton-Highlands-Norwood (ND),  
Leader of the New Democrat Opposition  
McAllister, Bruce, Chestermere-Rocky View (W),  
Official Opposition Deputy Whip  
McDonald, Everett, Grande Prairie-Smoky (PC)  
McIver, Hon. Ric, Calgary-Hays (PC),  
Deputy Government House Leader  
McQueen, Hon. Diana, Drayton Valley-Devon (PC)  
Notley, Rachel, Edmonton-Strathcona (ND),  
New Democrat Opposition House Leader  
Oberle, Hon. Frank, Peace River (PC)  
Olesen, Cathy, Sherwood Park (PC)  
Olson, Hon. Verlyn, QC, Wetaskiwin-Camrose (PC)  
Pastoor, Bridget Brennan, Lethbridge-East (PC)  
Pedersen, Blake, Medicine Hat (W)  
Quadri, Sohail, Edmonton-Mill Woods (PC)  
Quest, Dave, Strathcona-Sherwood Park (PC)  
Redford, Hon. Alison M., QC, Calgary-Elbow (PC),  
Premier  
Rodney, Hon. Dave, Calgary-Lougheed (PC)  
Rowe, Bruce, Olds-Didsbury-Three Hills (W)  
Sandhu, Peter, Edmonton-Manning (PC)  
Sarich, Janice, Edmonton-Decore (PC)  
Saskiw, Shayne, Lac La Biche-St. Paul-Two Hills (W),  
Official Opposition Deputy House Leader  
Scott, Hon. Donald, QC, Fort McMurray-Conklin (PC)  
Sherman, Dr. Raj, Edmonton-Meadowlark (AL),  
Leader of the Liberal Opposition  
Smith, Danielle, Highwood (W),  
Leader of the Official Opposition  
Starke, Dr. Richard, Vermilion-Lloydminster (PC)  
Stier, Pat, Livingstone-Macleod (W)  
Strankman, Rick, Drumheller-Stettler (W)  
Swann, Dr. David, Calgary-Mountain View (AL)  
Towle, Kerry, Innisfail-Sylvan Lake (W),  
Official Opposition Whip  
VanderBurg, Hon. George, Whitecourt-Ste. Anne (PC)  
Weadick, Hon. Greg, Lethbridge-West (PC)  
Webber, Len, Calgary-Foothills (PC)  
Wilson, Jeff, Calgary-Shaw (W)  
Woo-Paw, Hon. Teresa, Calgary-Northern Hills (PC)  
Xiao, David H., Edmonton-McClung (PC)  
Young, Steve, Edmonton-Riverview (PC),  
Government Whip

### Party standings:

Progressive Conservative: 61

Wildrose: 17

Alberta Liberal: 5

New Democrat: 4

### Officers and Officials of the Legislative Assembly

W.J. David McNeil, Clerk

Stephanie LeBlanc, Parliamentary Counsel  
and Legal Research Officer

Chris Caughell, Assistant Sergeant-at-Arms

Robert H. Reynolds, QC, Law Clerk/  
Director of Interparliamentary Relations

Philip Massolin, Manager of Research  
Services

Gordon H. Munk, Assistant Sergeant-at-Arms

Shannon Dean, Senior Parliamentary  
Counsel/Director of House Services

Brian G. Hodgson, Sergeant-at-Arms

Liz Sim, Managing Editor of *Alberta Hansard*

## **Executive Council**

Alison Redford	Premier, President of Executive Council
Thomas Lukaszuk	Deputy Premier, Ministerial Liaison to the Canadian Forces
Manmeet Singh Bhullar	Minister of Service Alberta
Robin Campbell	Minister of Aboriginal Relations
Christine Cusanelli	Minister of Tourism, Parks and Recreation
Cal Dallas	Minister of International and Intergovernmental Relations
Jonathan Denis	Minister of Justice and Solicitor General
Wayne Drysdale	Minister of Infrastructure
Kyle Fawcett	Associate Minister of Finance
Doug Griffiths	Minister of Municipal Affairs
Dave Hancock	Minister of Human Services
Fred Horne	Minister of Health
Doug Horner	President of Treasury Board and Minister of Finance
Ken Hughes	Minister of Energy
Jeff Johnson	Minister of Education
Stephen Khan	Minister of Enterprise and Advanced Education
Heather Klimchuk	Minister of Culture
Ric McIver	Minister of Transportation
Diana McQueen	Minister of Environment and Sustainable Resource Development
Frank Oberle	Associate Minister of Services for Persons with Disabilities
Verlyn Olson	Minister of Agriculture and Rural Development
Dave Rodney	Associate Minister of Wellness
Donald Scott	Associate Minister of Accountability, Transparency and Transformation
George VanderBurg	Associate Minister of Seniors
Greg Weadick	Associate Minister of Municipal Affairs
Teresa Woo-Paw	Associate Minister of International and Intergovernmental Relations

**STANDING AND SPECIAL COMMITTEES OF THE LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF ALBERTA**

**Standing Committee on Alberta's Economic Future**

Chair: Mr. Amery  
Deputy Chair: Mr. Bikman

Bhardwaj	Quadri
Blakeman	Quest
Donovan	Rogers
Dorward	Sandhu
Eggen	Sherman
Fenske	Smith
Goudreau	Starke
Hehr	Strankman
Jansen	Towle
Luan	Young
McDonald	Vacant
Olesen	

**Standing Committee on the Alberta Heritage Savings Trust Fund**

Chair: Mr. Quest  
Deputy Chair: Mrs. Jablonski

Anderson
Casey
Dorward
Eggen
Kubinec
Sandhu
Sherman

**Select Special Conflicts of Interest Act Review Committee**

Chair: Mr. Allen  
Deputy Chair: Mr. Luan

Blakeman
Dorward
Fenske
Johnson, L.
McDonald
Notley
Saskiw
Wilson
Young

**Standing Committee on Families and Communities**

Chair: Ms Pastoor  
Deputy Chair: Mrs. Forsyth

Allen	Leskiw
DeLong	Luan
Fox	McAllister
Fraser	Notley
Fritz	Pedersen
Jablonski	Sarich
Jansen	Saskiw
Jeneroux	Swann
Johnson, L.	Wilson
Kang	Young
Kubinec	Vacant
Lemke	

**Standing Committee on Legislative Offices**

Chair: Mr. Xiao  
Deputy Chair: Mr. McDonald

Bikman
Blakeman
Brown
DeLong
Eggen
Leskiw
Quadri
Rogers
Wilson

**Special Standing Committee on Members' Services**

Chair: Mr. Zwozdesky  
Deputy Chair: Mr. Young

Calahasen
Dorward
Forsyth
Goudreau
Jablonski
Mason
Quest
Sherman
Smith

**Standing Committee on Private Bills**

Chair: Mr. Cao  
Deputy Chair: Ms L. Johnson

Barnes	Notley
Bhardwaj	Olesen
Brown	Pastoor
DeLong	Rowe
Fox	Sarich
Fritz	Starke
Goudreau	Strankman
Jeneroux	Swann
Kennedy-Glans	Webber
Luan	

**Standing Committee on Privileges and Elections, Standing Orders and Printing**

Chair: Dr. Starke  
Deputy Chair: Mr. Lemke

Allen	McAllister
Amery	McDonald
Bhardwaj	Notley
Casey	Pedersen
Hehr	Sandhu
Jansen	Saskiw
Jeneroux	Towle
Johnson, L.	Xiao
Kennedy-Glans	Young
Kubinec	

**Standing Committee on Public Accounts**

Chair: Mr. Anderson  
Deputy Chair: Mr. Dorward

Allen	Hale
Amery	Hehr
Anglin	Kang
Bilous	Pastoor
Calahasen	Quadri
DeLong	Sarich
Donovan	Starke
Fenske	Stier
Fraser	Webber
Fritz	

**Standing Committee on Resource Stewardship**

Chair: Ms Kennedy-Glans  
Deputy Chair: Mr. Rowe

Anderson	Hehr
Anglin	Johnson, L.
Barnes	Kubinec
Bilous	Lemke
Blakeman	Leskiw
Brown	Sandhu
Calahasen	Stier
Cao	Webber
Casey	Xiao
Fenske	Young
Fraser	Vacant
Hale	

## Legislative Assembly of Alberta

1:30 p.m.

Thursday, December 6, 2012

[The Speaker in the chair]

### Prayers

**The Speaker:** Hon. members, today's prayer is dedicated to innocent victims of violence.

Let us pray. Life is precious, and when it is lost, all of us are impacted. Today we join with Legislatures right across Canada and honour the National Day of Remembrance and Action on Violence against Women. This day of remembrance marks the anniversary of the 1989 massacre of 14 women students at l'école Polytechnique in Montreal. Hon. members, please join me in observing one minute of silence. Amen. Thank you.

Just before I invite you to be seated, please know that the flags on the Alberta Legislature Building here have been lowered since sunrise this day and will remain lowered until sunset this evening in honour of these innocent victims who were massacred because they were women. Please be seated.

### Introduction of Guests

**The Speaker:** The hon. Member for Leduc-Beaumont.

**Mr. Rogers:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. It's a great privilege to introduce to you and through you to all members of this Assembly a group of individuals in the galleries today who play a key role in the democratic process in the province of Alberta. The employees who work in our constituency offices often provide the first point of contact for our constituents and represent our offices and this Assembly. These special individuals are here today participating in the winter constituency employee seminar, which provides an opportunity for them to network with other LAO staff and obtain an overview of numerous programs and services available through the LAO.

Each year the services and contributions of these individuals are celebrated with an employee recognition dinner, which you, Mr. Speaker, will be hosting later this evening. Today over 75 constituency office employees are with us from all corners of the province. I would ask that they please rise and receive the warm traditional welcome of this Assembly.

**The Speaker:** Thank you, indeed.

The hon. Member for Fort Saskatchewan-Vegreville.

**Ms Fenske:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. It is my pleasure to introduce to you and through you today to all members of this Assembly on behalf of the hon. Member for Bonnyville-Cold Lake a group of 46 students from Holy Cross elementary school in Cold Lake. They are seated in the members' gallery today, and accompanying them are teachers and group leaders Ms Jo-Ann Ward, Mrs. Bev Armbruster, Mrs. Nadia Corriveau, Miss Kristin Bertrand; and their parents, Mrs. Denise Reid and Mrs. Charlene McKay. I would ask that they all rise and receive the traditional warm greeting of this Assembly.

**The Speaker:** The hon. Minister of Infrastructure.

**Mr. Drysdale:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. It is indeed my honour to introduce to you and through you today a constituent of mine, Mr. Andre Harpe. Mr. Harpe has worked for many years volunteering on lots of different boards in my constituency to make our com-

munity better for all of our community members. I believe Mr. Harpe is in the city today serving on the Northern Alberta Development Council board as well. I'd ask Mr. Harpe to stand and receive the warm welcome of this Assembly.

**The Speaker:** The hon. Member for Edmonton-South West.

**Mr. Jeneroux:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I am pleased to introduce to you and through you to all members of the Assembly Ms Dawn Harsch, owner and operator of ExquisiCare, a facility offering residential and supportive living accommodations and care for the elderly, located in my constituency of Edmonton-South West. I've had the opportunity to tour the facility with the hon. Minister of Health and appreciate the service that ExquisiCare provides to the residents. The personal care philosophy of love, home, purposeful living, and meaningful work is practised on a daily basis at ExquisiCare. With Ms Harsch today is Ms Lori Seemann, with Canadian Natural Resources. I ask that the two guests seated in the members' gallery today please rise and receive the traditional welcome of the Assembly.

**The Speaker:** The hon. Minister of Culture.

**Mrs. Klimchuk:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. It's my pleasure to rise today to introduce to you and through you a very special guest seated in the members' gallery. April Lamb, who was born and raised in Medicine Hat, is a student at Mount Royal University studying to achieve her bachelor of communications with a specialization in journalism. April served in my ministry as a summer ministerial intern this summer and now works as an assistant in the hon. Premier's southern Alberta office. I would ask April to rise and receive the traditional warm welcome of this Assembly.

**The Speaker:** Thank you.

The hon. Member for Innisfail-Sylvan Lake.

**Mrs. Towle:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. It's an honour to introduce to you and through you 17 Wildrose constituency office staff members here today. These fantastic people work hard for Albertans and our Wildrose MLAs every day, and without them our jobs would be incredibly difficult. Please rise and receive the warm welcome of this Assembly, and thank you.

**The Speaker:** The hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre.

**Ms Blakeman:** I do have guests coming, but I believe they're not in the gallery currently, so I'll ask to revert at the end of question period.

**The Speaker:** We'll come back.

Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark, if your guests are here, proceed.

**Dr. Sherman:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I'd like to introduce to you and through you to all members of this Assembly some of the bravest Albertans, the staff of the Alberta Liberal opposition. They're also rumoured to be pretty darned good dancers in a recently released popular video named *Sherman Style*. I'd like them to rise as I call their names. Jonathan Huckabay, our chief of staff, and the team: Justin Benko, Denis Lapointe, Jon Mastel, Amy McBain, Tyler Mudrey, Carmen Remenda, Kevin Tam, and Nicky Walker. There may only be nine of them, but they do the work of 300, and without them we could not do what we do each and every day to hold the government to account for our real bosses, the people. Please join me in giving them the traditional warm welcome of the Assembly.

1:40

**The Speaker:** The hon. Member for Barrhead-Morinville-Westlock.

**Ms Kubinec:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. It is my pleasure to introduce to you and through you to the members of the Legislature a long-time friend and a mentor of mine, Ms Honey Forbes. She's up in the visitors' gallery. After spending the majority of her life in my fantastic constituency of Barrhead-Morinville-Westlock, Honey and Daryl and their family moved to Duncan, B.C., on Vancouver Island, where she is now a coroner at the medical examiner's. The last time Honey was here was when she was here with her daughters in grade 6. One of those daughters grew up to be one of my youth campaign workers. I am very proud to be able to introduce Honey to this Assembly today and to ask that she rise and that we give her the traditional warm welcome of the Assembly.

**The Speaker:** The hon. Member for Dunvegan-Central Peace-Notley.

**Mr. Goudreau:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. It's also my pleasure to introduce to you and through you to the members of this Assembly Mayor Brian Allen. Brian has been mayor of the town of Grimshaw for multiple terms. He's a tremendous supporter and is also here to do NADC business. I would like Mayor Brian Allen to stand and receive the traditional warm welcome of the Assembly.

**The Speaker:** Hon. Member for Edmonton-Decore, you have a guest?

**Mrs. Sarich:** Yes. Thank you, Mr. Speaker. It's an honour and privilege for me to rise today to introduce to you and through you to all Members of the Legislative Assembly a very special guest and long-time resident of Edmonton-Decore, Mr. Jimmy Ragsdale. Mr. Ragsdale on many occasions drops by the constituency office to simply say hello, and it's a welcome breath of fresh air when he does that and is welcomed by the staff that works in the constituency office. The Alberta Legislature has such a rich history of traditions and democracy, and Mr. Ragsdale is here to observe the Assembly in action this afternoon. I would ask that Mr. Ragsdale now please rise – he is seated in the public gallery – and ask that we give him the traditional warm welcome of the Assembly.

Thank you.

### Members' Statements

**The Speaker:** Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, I believe you're up.

### Personal Code of Conduct

**Mr. Dorward:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. In May you asked us to come up with our own personal code of conduct in this Assembly. I have some thoughts for you. Firstly, I will never disrespect the hallowed walls of this Assembly. We teach children daily on tours that this House represents the very democracy that we enjoy. That includes respect for you and your position in this Assembly. I will never hold up a sign calling you a name. I will never swear behind your back. I will never walk out on this Assembly in the name of political protest. I will not bend your rules or your rulings. I understand the difference between governing party, loyal opposition, and politics.

Mr. Speaker, I will never disrespect the Premier of our province. She is duly elected as the Premier of the people. When she is attacked and disrespected, every member in this Assembly is disrespected, the government is disrespected, and every citizen of this province should feel disrespected.

I will choose not to use every opportunity I can for political opportunism in this Assembly. I will not use valuable and costly Assembly time on endless political speeches largely unrelated to the business before the Assembly.

Mr. Speaker, I will not lie in this Assembly. I will not bend the truth in this Assembly. I will not leave out truths that show the complete story, indeed. I will speak frankly and on topic in the Assembly. I will not bring potty language to this Assembly.

Thank you, Mr. Speaker, for challenging us in this way. What a contrast between the behaviours in the Assembly this fall. There are those who have held a high standard and those who have wallowed in misunderstanding of what we're about.

Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

**The Speaker:** The hon. Member for Calgary-Mountain View.

### Physician Services Agreement

**Dr. Swann:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Our health care system is fragile after several years of reorganizations without a clear plan. Recent breakdown in the relationship of physicians and this government in a season of likely increased demands makes this even more dangerous for citizens of Alberta who absolutely rely on timely access and effective care, even those among us. The mutual blame game must stop in the interest of all Albertans. What has become clear is that a heavy-handed approach by the Minister of Health and his unwillingness to respect the rights of the AMA, as the bargaining agent, to return to good-faith negotiations based on principles rather than a fixed position is blocking progress. Inflammatory public ads on both sides do not help the search for resolution. Earnest negotiation and, ultimately, binding arbitration as supported by the Canada Health Act must be the focus.

Adding to the barriers to good-faith bargaining has been the failure to honestly consult with physicians about the plan to build 140 new family care centres without evidence, consultation with primary care networks, or a budget plan. This needs to be acknowledged and addressed. We know the minister and the AMA share the goals of improved access, excellent quality, and cost-effectiveness, and these must form the basis of renewed discussions, with an intermediary as previously agreed to.

The need for more prevention programs and additional resources for community care to keep people out of this health care system is essential to strengthening it and ensuring future sustainability. Preventable delays, complications, even deaths are a real and present concern today in Alberta. Nothing can justify adding these challenges, nor do we want fear or lasting bitterness to add to morale problems festering amongst health professionals today.

In all our interests we entreat both sides: return to discussions with a third party, resolve outstanding issues. Albertans deserve no less.

Thank you.

**The Speaker:** The hon. Member for Banff-Cochrane.

### FireSmart Funding

**Mr. Casey:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. The Alberta government recently announced \$500,000 in FireSmart community grant funding for 16 forested communities. [interjections] I agree. Funding supports projects that reduce wildfire risks such as planning

and development controls, tree thinning, public education, training, and emergency management.

In my constituency of Banff-Cochrane the investment will go a long way to FireSmart three communities sharing \$105,000 in grants. The summer village of Waiparous and the Kananaskis improvement district will each receive a grant of \$50,000 for FireSmart planning and vegetation management while Canmore will put \$5,000 towards FireSmart education. Two other communities in the area that will receive funding are Crowsnest Pass, who will receive \$50,000 towards vegetation management, education, and training; and Mountain View county, who will put \$15,000 towards a FireSmart training exercise. All five of these communities have embraced FireSmart practices and share a responsibility for good stewardship of Alberta forests.

I would also like to take this opportunity to recognize the work of members of the Kananaskis improvement district's FireSmart Committee, who were invited to a workshop in September led by the researchers from Oregon State University, the University of Alberta, and Charles Sturt University in Australia. The Kananaskis improvement district's FireSmart Committee was chosen to participate in the project to share their best practices and to provide researchers with feedback for a fire management guide they are developing.

Please join me in commending the Kananaskis FireSmart Committee for their important work and to congratulate the summer village of Waiparous, Canmore, Crowsnest Pass, and Mountain View county as recipients in this latest round of FireSmart funding.

Thank you.

**The Speaker:** Hon. members, just before we start the clock for question period, I'll remind you that all the rules are in force as always. I may come back and make a comment in general about private members' statements at the end of the day.

### Oral Question Period

**The Speaker:** The hon. Leader of Her Majesty's Loyal Opposition.

#### Tobacco Recovery Lawsuit

**Ms Smith:** Mr. Speaker, we're having a difficult time getting to the bottom of the tobacco contingency arrangement. We've asked four times, and we're going to ask again. In the Premier's December 14, 2010, memorandum she wrote that the International Tobacco Recovery Lawyers would be the best choice "considering the perceived conflicts of interest, actual conflicts of interest, the structure of the contingency arrangement and the importance of a 'made in Alberta' litigation plan." Can the Premier assure Albertans that in her examination of the bids, the winning proposal was the one that offered the lowest contingency fee?

1:50

**Ms Redford:** Mr. Speaker, this was the question that was asked yesterday by the opposition, and I answered the question.

I'd like to take a moment to pause and think about what the opposition has actually done this session. I'd like to ask the Leader of the Official Opposition a question. While we have had repetitive questions that have been answered by this side of the House on a regular basis, Mr. Speaker, this hon. member, who claims to be the critic for International Relations, Aboriginal Relations, and cities, in 22 days has asked one question with respect to those issues that she cares about.

I would refer the hon. member to my answers that I have answered continually in this House with respect to the other

matter, and I look forward to a question on something she tells Albertans she cares about.

**Ms Smith:** No wonder Albertans are losing confidence. She can't answer a simple question.

Even if we were willing to pretend for a moment that up is down and the sky really is green and that the Premier did not make the decision on this issue – fair enough – but when the Premier looked at the bids, did she see that the Jensen consortium's contingency proposal was indeed the lowest contingency fee?

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

**Mr. Denis:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. This question has been asked and answered many times. The final decision was made by the succeeding Justice minister, who is currently the agriculture minister. As we keep moving on, we are on the side of the average Alberta taxpayer, not big tobacco. How about this member?

#### Speaker's Ruling Decorum

**The Speaker:** Hon. members, you were very kind in acknowledging the staff who support you today. Let us think about what you're showing them today as well. Please, no more interjections. No more heckling is needed here. We're all grown adults. We'd like to hear each other ask questions. We'd like to hear the answers as well.

Hon. leader, please proceed with your next question.

#### Tobacco Recovery Lawsuit (continued)

**Ms Smith:** Okay. With tens, perhaps hundreds, of millions of dollars at stake we just want to make sure that the winning bid had the lowest contingency fee. That's what I'm asking again. Yes or no?

**Mr. Denis:** Mr. Speaker, as I indicated yesterday, our own counsel has advised us that in the event we would disclose the contingency agreement, it would be in the interest not of Alberta taxpayers but of big tobacco. And if you don't believe him, go to the former president of the Law Society, Perry Mack, who said the same thing.

**The Speaker:** Let's try one more time, shall we?

Hon. leader, you have the floor.

#### Details of Meetings with Katz Group Inc.

**Ms Smith:** We'll try to get an answer to another question, Mr. Speaker. Yesterday I asked the Minister of Finance to make good on his October 30 commitment to give details about his meetings with the Katz Group when the government said no to arena funding and casino licences. Now, the minister brushed off the questions, saying that he'd already answered them. But he didn't. On October 31, responding to a different question about lobbyists for the Katz Group, the minister provided the name of Peter Elzinga, who was indeed registered as the lobbyist for this group in 2010. We are trying to figure out who the government met with from the Katz Group in 2011 and 2012. When will he keep his promise and provide the details that I originally asked for?

**Mr. Horner:** Well, Mr. Speaker, as I think is fairly common knowledge in this House, during 2011 I was otherwise occupied and was

meeting with a lot of people during that period of time. In the 2010 time period was the original meeting which I spoke about.

As I recall, in response to my answer yesterday the hon. member said that she'll put it in writing, so I'm waiting for her to put it in writing.

**Ms Smith:** Mr. Speaker, you've told us often that when a minister answers, he's answering on the part of government, so that's what I'm asking. Given the minister told the Assembly back in October that it's not a secret, why won't he keep his promise and provide the details of all of the meetings the government had with the Katz Group in 2011 and 2012?

**Mr. Horner:** Well, Mr. Speaker, I wouldn't know whether the Katz Group has met with other members of the cabinet in either 2011, in a previous government, or in 2010. I did make the comment that I would provide the date of the meeting that I had with them either in 2012 or 2010, and I will do that.

**Ms Smith:** Well, Mr. Speaker, I asked for it on October 30, and we still haven't received it. It now looks like the minister is just giving us another brush-off. Is this just another example of the government's policy of renegeing on its commitments and breaking promises?

**Mr. Horner:** Absolutely not, Mr. Speaker. I've made the commitment that I'll find the date. I don't actually have the calendar in my memory right now as to the exact date when we met with representatives of the group. I will say this. The answer was no in 2010. The answer, as I understand it, was no in 2011. The answer was no 2012. The answer will be no in 2013. I think the hon. member is chasing a dead horse here.\*

**The Speaker:** The hon. Leader of Her Majesty's Loyal Opposition. Third main set of questions, and no preambles on the sups this time, please.

### Opposition Amendments to Bills

**Ms Smith:** Yes. Thank you. You'll be happy with these questions, Mr. Speaker.

I want to acknowledge all of my opposition colleagues for the great work we did by proposing more than a hundred amendments to government bills, but despite the Premier's stated goal of more free votes, more time between proposing and voting, more collaboration, the government rejected pretty much everything we put forward. It's another case of the Premier saying one thing and doing another or, as with the tobacco deal, doing one thing and saying another. To the Premier: how does unanimously rejecting more than a hundred amendments square with the desire for more free votes and more collaboration?

**Ms Redford:** Mr. Speaker, this has been a fantastic session, where we have passed 10 pieces of legislation that matter to Albertans. We've delivered on an election act, elections financing legislation, whistle-blower legislation, homebuyers' protection legislation. We've acknowledged posttraumatic stress disorder, and we have ensured that the regulatory process will protect the property rights of landowners. [interjections]

Mr. Speaker, what we do as a government is that before we bring legislation to this House, we consult with stakeholders. We ensure that our legislation is strong, and we're proud of our legislative record this . . .

**The Speaker:** Thank you.

**Ms Smith:** What about the amendment that would close the Katz loophole that allowed huge donations from a single source? Why did your government reject this?

**Ms Redford:** Mr. Speaker, the legislation that was passed reflects what Albertans want to see with respect to integrity and honesty and independence in this House. I can't speak to the fact that the opposition may have introduced amendments that were erroneous, irrelevant, and not important, but what I will say is that Albertans voted for a government that was committed to transparency and to honesty. The issues we've debated in this House have been a result of changes that we on this front bench have made with respect to transparency, and that is the record that we will stand by.

**Ms Smith:** What about the Lynn Redford amendment that would have opened up details of illegal contributions dating all the way back to 2005? Now, we can guess why that was rejected, but why doesn't the Premier tell us?

**Ms Redford:** Mr. Speaker, to me this question period is nothing but an exclamation point on the decorum that has been inappropriately shown in this House. I will tell you that there are a lot of processes in place, that we put in place, with respect to disclosure, with respect to inquiries, and with respect to expenses, which is the reason that the opposition can ask these questions. [interjections] I will tell you that from what we have heard in our caucus over the last weekend, these sorts of comments are entirely inappropriate. They do not dignify this institution, and I'm not surprised to hear them from the Leader of the Opposition.

**The Speaker:** Hon. members, you can see what happens if one or two interjections get thrown in and cause some distraction. They lead to some disruption.

We're going to proceed with the leader of the Alberta Liberal opposition, followed, maybe, by the leader of the New Democratic opposition.

The hon. leader of the Liberal opposition.

### Personal Care Standards in Seniors' Facilities

**Dr. Sherman:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. 'Twas the last day of session, and all through the House a Premier was sitting as quiet as a mouse. Christmas is coming, and we're all filled with cheer, except for the seniors, that we hold so dear. Today we heard about the gift that Randa Wheaton gave her elderly friend in long-term care, money for an extra bath every other week for a year. In a province blessed with so much wealth, it would be easy for the government to honour the sacrifices of our pioneers, entrepreneurs, and veterans by giving them the gift of basic dignity. To the Premier: why won't you open up your heart this Christmas, as Randa Wheaton did, by giving every vulnerable Albertan in care the gift of more than one bath a week?

2:00

**Mr. Horne:** Mr. Speaker, the hon. Premier gave the hon. Leader of the Official Opposition some good advice a few minutes ago, I think, when she suggested that the hon. member take a pause. I suggest that this hon. member do the same. If members of this House want to have a debate about protocols with respect to bathing, that's one thing. If they are actually suggesting that the health care workers of this province are inappropriately caring for personal hygiene of the residents of our long-term care facilities, that's quite another, and frankly I think they should have the guts to stand up and allege that.

\*See page 1349, left column, paragraph 12

**Dr. Sherman:** Mr. Speaker, given that what's missing in the words "health care" from the government's point of view is the key word "care," that's what my question is on. Again to the Premier. You promised to put families and communities first. Will you do so today by ordering a change in government policy in funding more than one bath a week? Please, Premier, will you?

**Mr. Horne:** Mr. Speaker, what is, in fact, disingenuous is poetry added to innuendo to suggest that in some way the health care workers of this province are not providing appropriately for the personal hygiene needs of residents in our province. As that hon. member should know, care plans for residents are determined by the residents and their families in consultation with the workers that provide care to them. If this hon. member wants to have a debate about standards or protocols at an operational level, I suggest he find a way to do it besides a cheap poem.

**The Speaker:** The hon. member, with no preamble this time, please.

**Dr. Sherman:** Mr. Speaker, given that every prisoner locked up in our province's jail system is allowed to have a shower a day and given that even the Grinch had a change of heart, my final question to the Premier. Please afford me the dignity of standing up and answering this question. It's Christmastime. Will you order your government to treat vulnerable Albertans, many of whom are veterans, better than the common thief by ordering that they get more than one bath a week?

**Mr. Horne:** Mr. Speaker, a question like that doesn't deserve the dignity of an answer from the Premier of this province. As this hon. member knows, we have a process in place to determine care plans for residents in our seniors' facilities. We have said earlier in response to other questions this week that the hon. Associate Minister of Seniors, in whose judgment I trust, is looking into the matter with respect to the specific protocols. We have requested some information from Alberta Health Services in this regard to support the review, and we will respond accordingly and with dignity.

#### Speaker's Ruling Insisting on Answers

**The Speaker:** Hon. members, given that last exchange and some comments and actions that followed, let me refer you to *House of Commons Procedure and Practice*, page 510, chapter 11, with respect to questions, and here's what it says. "Members may not insist on an answer nor may a Member insist that a specific Minister respond to his or her question." You are reminded to read onward after that for more comments.

**Ms Blakeman:** Point of order, Mr. Speaker.

**The Speaker:** A point of order has been raised at 2:05 by Edmonton-Centre. It's been noted.

Let's move on now with the hon. leader of the New Democratic opposition.

#### Donations to Political Parties

**Mr. Mason:** Thanks very much, Mr. Speaker. Albertans have been demanding answers on a number of matters, including the massive donation from Daryl Katz and his associates, what the Premier knew about her sister's illegal donations, and if she was in a conflict of interest relative to the award of a lawsuit contract

to the tobacco firm. To the Premier: why won't she come clean about the \$430,000 donation from Daryl Katz and his associates, release the cheque, and stop hiding behind the Chief Electoral Officer and his secret investigation?

**Ms Redford:** These questions have been answered more than once in this House, Mr. Speaker. There is a system in place that ensures not only that when these questions are raised, the government answers these questions but that there are independent processes in place to ensure that Albertans can have confidence that the answers that the government is giving are correct and true. Those processes are terribly important for all of us to ensure that we as politicians, as people involved in this House, and as citizens of Alberta can have confidence in these institutions and will respect them.

**The Speaker:** The hon. leader.

**Mr. Mason:** Thanks, Mr. Speaker. Given that these questions have been asked over and over and given that they've been answered never and given that there have been dozens and dozens of illegal donations to the PC Party and that one of them apparently included a donation by the Premier's sister, why has the Premier refused to tell Albertans what she knew about this and when she knew it?

**Mr. Lukaszuk:** Mr. Speaker, correct me if I'm wrong, but I think you have made rulings on matters relative to political parties. Notwithstanding that, we also note that in this country, unless something has changed overnight, nothing is illegal unless somebody had a fair process and was found to have done something illegal. No one is in conflict of interest unless he or she has gone through a process and was found to be in conflict of interest. These questions, these allusions are simply inappropriate and can be very hurtful to individuals who are not here to defend themselves.

**The Speaker:** The hon. leader, with no preamble, please.

**Mr. Mason:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. Well, given that the government has turned up the arrogance dial to overload, given that the Premier walks out on people in the middle of questions, what has the government got to say about the supreme arrogance that it has shown in this session, the absolute contempt for the democratic traditions of this Assembly, the absolute contempt for the opposition, the attempts to sideline the media, and complete disregard for the interests of the public, that are represented by people in this Assembly?

**The Speaker:** Hon. members, please, let's not hit any notes lower than have already been hit in this session.

Someone to respond?

**Mr. Lukaszuk:** Mr. Speaker, I think that not only the Premier but every member of the front bench and of cabinet has answered many of these questions on many occasions. There seems to be some delusional belief on the other side of this House that if they spend the entire session asking a set of five questions 55 times each, somehow they think they will get a different answer. There is only one answer for every question because there is only one truthful answer for every question. They have been receiving it. They simply don't like the truth. It's unfortunate that they won't let the truth get in the way of their work.

**The Speaker:** The hon. Member for Medicine Hat, followed by Barrhead-Morinville-Westlock.

### Travel and Expense Reporting

**Mr. Pedersen:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. The Summer Olympics continue to provide entertainment for all Albertans. In addition to huge bills for the Premier's plane tickets and all those empty hotel rooms, now we see the Minister of Tourism, Parks and Recreation actually using her government credit card to pay thousands of dollars for flights for her family. How on earth can this minister think that it was really okay and an acceptable action by a minister of government?

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

**Ms Cusanelli:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I am the minister, I am the MLA, and I'm responsible for my expenses. I needed to have paid closer attention to the manner in which they were being processed, and for that I've apologized to Albertans. Again, I want to convey to Albertans today that for me this job is about doing the best work that I possibly can. Going forward with the travel and expense policy that we have initiated as a government, I feel very confident that Albertans are going to be able to see that this government truly understands and truly wishes to ensure that we use taxpayer dollars effectively.

**The Speaker:** The hon. member.

**Mr. Pedersen:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Sure, the minister paid it back, but Albertans are left to wonder if she would have done so if she hadn't been caught as a result of opposition pressure for more openness, accountability, and transparency on government expenses.

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

**Ms Cusanelli:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Once again I will say what my commitment is to this province. This province can see from me that I am going to be committed to Albertans: to developing trails, to ensuring that we have after-school programs for children to be active, to ensuring that I meet with my stakeholders in order to find the best ways possible to encourage and improve our industries. That is what I intend to be here to do regardless of what the opposition will try to convey to Albertans.

2:10

**The Speaker:** The hon. member.

**Mr. Pedersen:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Given that athletes lose their medals when they get caught using performance-enhancing drugs, what will this minister lose now that she's been caught using entitlement-enhancing items like her golden government credit card?

**Ms Cusanelli:** Mr. Speaker, there is one thing that I have always been committed to in any of the careers that I've endeavoured, and that is integrity. Where these expenses were incurred, I ensured that they were reimbursed or allocated appropriately. Albertans can expect that from me going forward, and Albertans can expect that this entire government, this cabinet, this caucus are committed to ensuring that we are transparent and that we are accountable for our actions. I have shown that here today.

**The Speaker:** The hon. Member for Barrhead-Morinville-Westlock, followed by Airdrie.

### Fall Session Accomplishments

**Ms Kubinec:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. It has been a raucous and emotional fall session of the Alberta Legislature, but through it all this Assembly did pass 10 pieces of legislation. My first question is to the Government House Leader. Can you please tell us what you consider to be the most significant accomplishments of this fall session?

**Mr. Hancock:** Well, thank you, Mr. Speaker. I think it is appropriate for us to focus at the end of the fall session on the good work that's been done by this Legislature on all sides of the House. We have dealt with 10 substantive pieces of legislation in a relatively short period of time, because the fall session doesn't afford a long period of time, and good work in terms of PTSD support for our front-line workers, the Education Act, regulatory reform, protection for new-home buyers, a lot of very significant legislation notwithstanding the other antics of the House in trying to insinuate that somehow integrity is the issue.

**Ms Blakeman:** Mr. Speaker, a point of order.

**The Speaker:** Hon. members, as you all know, the purpose of question period is to seek information and to hold the government to account, so let's see how you do with your supplemental.

**Ms Kubinec:** My first supplemental is to the same minister. Can you please tell us: what are the disappointments or regrets from this session in terms of implementing government policy?

**The Speaker:** Hon. member, really? Frankly, I've never heard that sort of question before, but given that it's been asked by a new member, I will allow it this one time. If somebody from government wishes to provide an answer, I'd be most anxious to hear what it is.

**Mr. Hancock:** Well, thank you, Mr. Speaker. In my view and the 15 years of experience I've had as a member of government as well as a Member of the Legislative Assembly, what I really find exciting about this House and why I really love the opportunity we have in this House is because it's at the apex of the process. The work that we do here ensures that all the other work – consulting Albertans, putting together solid pieces of legislation, being able to bring forward that legislation to the House so that we can examine it in detail here but making sure that in most cases it's ready to go by the time it gets here – has been done by the time we achieve this.

**Ms Kubinec:** Mr. Speaker, to the same minister: could you please tell us why all 106 amendments were not passed?

**The Speaker:** The hon. Government House Leader.

**Mr. Hancock:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. As House Leader I often have said to members opposite that when they have the opportunity to be briefed on legislation, which they usually are before the legislation hits the House, and when they see the legislation, if they have amendments that they want to bring forward that make appropriate changes to the legislation, make the legislation stronger, and if they share them with us so that I can share them with caucus and we can look at any unintended consequences, we're more than happy to deal with those amendments. If, on the other hand, they have amendments which are simply political platforms, they'll be dealt with as political platforms on the floor of the House.

**Mr. Anderson:** Point of order, Mr. Speaker.

**The Speaker:** A point of order by Airdrie has been raised at 2:15 and has been noted, and on that note let me recognize the hon. Member for Airdrie for his set of questions.

### Justice System

**Mr. Anderson:** Mr. Speaker, we now have more proof of just how dysfunctional our justice system has become due to a lack of Crown and court resources. Jetandar Dhillon recently pleaded guilty in Ontario for driving his semi truck into a fire truck while under the influence. Incredibly, Mr. Dhillon had been awaiting trial in Alberta for an alleged DUI for almost two years at the time that he got into the accident. And guess what? His charges were eventually stayed in Alberta because of court and Crown delays. Minister, how many people need to suffer before you and the Premier take responsibility for and address the critical lack of resources in our justice system?

**Mr. Denis:** Mr. Speaker, that is a bit of a mendacity. I would agree with the member that it's unfortunate when cases don't make it to trial, but let's stick to the facts. Let's stick to the truth here. In this case it was not because of unreasonable delay. Rather, it was a prosecutorial error. Now, I'm in no way throwing the prosecutor under the bus. He has a very strong history with our department. This case is also under review for appeal, and I hesitate to comment in detail because I want the Crown to have its own independent look at this and see if we should appeal.

**Mr. Anderson:** There was a 10-month delay, Mr. Speaker – a 10-month delay – between the mistake you talked about and the next time the court got to look at the case.

Given that victims are entitled to their day in court and given that we must not trample on the Charter of Rights of an accused to be presumed innocent until proven guilty, instead of giving lengthy suspensions of licences prior to a person actually being convicted of a DUI, which is probably not constitutional, as we may soon find out, why not invest the resources necessary to unlog our courts, empower our Crown prosecutors, and get these menaces to society off Alberta's streets?

**Mr. Denis:** Again, Mr. Speaker, for the exact same reason that this member identifies, that is why we're putting more judges on the bench, we're looking at more Crown prosecutors, and we're even looking at where we can expand our judicial system throughout this entire province.

**Mr. Anderson:** Given that you have not done so, Minister, and given that the Keeping Communities Safe report from 2007, chaired by the Member for Calgary-Fish Creek, specifically recommended that your government publicly post all of the cases stayed due to court and Crown delays, will you agree to accept and implement that recommendation, and will you use that information to craft a strategy to unlog the justice system and ensure that criminals are convicted and that the innocent are acquitted as quickly as possible? Will you not do those things?

**Mr. Denis:** Mr. Speaker, as I've indicated, this government has taken many kinds of steps, but I'll point one thing out to this particular member. If our Bill 26 law on drinking and driving, which this member opposes, had been in place, if this had happened before September 1, this particular individual would have been taken off the road and lost his licence. It's time for this member to admit that this law saves lives.

**The Speaker:** The hon. Member for Calgary-Varsity, followed by Calgary-Mountain View.

### Results-based Budgeting Review

**Ms Kennedy-Glans:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. My constituents in Calgary-Varsity are asking me some pretty tough, informed, and I think appropriate questions about fiscal discipline, including questions about our ability to keep operating costs in check. My first question is to the President of Treasury Board and Minister of Finance. How can I assure my constituents that the results-based budgeting process will be a catalyst for more disciplined approaches to operating cost management by this government?

**Mr. Horner:** Mr. Speaker, the results-based budgeting is a comprehensive process, and it will examine each and every program and service government delivers. Each review will determine if the program or service is relevant to Albertans, whether it's being delivered efficiently and effectively, and if it's achieving the outcomes that Albertans expect. Essentially, results-based budgeting is about outcomes. Results-based budgeting will help the government move away from the incremental budgeting that we've been prone to in the past. Instead, we'll be funding allocation of resources to the results.

**The Speaker:** The hon. member.

**Ms Kennedy-Glans:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Again to the same minister: how in depth will these reviews be? For example, will they examine whether the purpose of the programs is in line with the goals of government, not just looking at the operating costs within a program but the need for the program itself?

**Mr. Horner:** Mr. Speaker, no one size will fit all. As described in the first-year progress report, which was tabled in the House, we are going to put some flexibility into the process. In one form or another the reviews are to include questions around the relevance, the efficiency, and the effectiveness of our programs. These programs and services would have been put in place for Albertans to achieve some objective. We want to make sure that that objective is still relevant. In addition, we have 31 Albertans that have agreed to participate in the review process by sitting on the challenge panels to make sure that they are in-depth challenges.

**Ms Kennedy-Glans:** Again to the same minister: what about the consequences? Can you tell us what the consequences will be if the challenge panel identifies programs that are no longer achieving their intended outcomes or if the desired objectives can be achieved better through other means?

2:20

**Mr. Horner:** Well, Mr. Speaker, the objective of the whole exercise is to do exactly that, ensure that we have relevant programs and services that are providing value for Alberta taxpayers. If the findings of the review of a given program or service are that it's no longer achieving its intended outcomes, then we will change so that we can achieve those outcomes if they're still relevant.

**The Speaker:** The hon. Member for Calgary-Mountain View, followed by Edmonton-Strathcona.

### Child Labour Standards

**Dr. Swann:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. Paid child labour, interfering with schooling in some cases, is being publicly acknowledged by the Wild Rose Agricultural Producers president,

Lynn Jacobson, quoted in the *Taber Times* this week saying: "Child labour is getting to be an issue in a lot of areas, and maybe in southern Alberta more so." Also this week a letter from the vice-president of McDonald's foods acknowledges child labour concerns, and I'll be tabling that today. To the Minister of Human Services: how many major corporations like Pepsi, Frito-Lay, and McDonald's as well as agricultural producers are needed to get this government to bring in child labour standards in Alberta?

**Mr. Hancock:** Well, Mr. Speaker, we do have child labour standards in Alberta under the occupational health and safety standards and the workplace standards. You can't employ a child under 12 except in certain specific categories without a specific permit, which you can apply for, so that there can be an investigation with respect to whether that's an appropriate job. You can only employ children between 13 and 15 years of age in certain circumstances and not interfere with their education. For those over 16 there are other regulations. There are many standards with respect to the employment of children in this province.

**Dr. Swann:** Well, the minister effectively avoided the question of agricultural operations.

With Alberta's injury centre identifying recently increased rates of child injury as well as deaths every year, as the minister is well aware, some as paid farm workers, and the Judge Barley report of four years ago calling for health and safety standards on industrial farming operations, how long must children wait for action from this minister?

**Mr. Hancock:** Mr. Speaker, the Judge Barley report had nothing to do with child labour on farms, and I didn't hear him refer to farms in his first question with respect to child labour standards.

I think that it's important that we do have appropriate safety processes in place in every industry across the province, that we encourage the agriculture industry, like every other industry, to take safety seriously and to ensure that there are appropriate safety standards for all their workers, not just children. The one thing that we do need to be clear on is that we use statistics appropriately in this House and in this discussion because it's a very serious discussion. Every death on a family farm involving children has not been related to the workplace. In fact, most of them, as you read the statistics, have to do with . . .

**The Speaker:** Hon. member, you have one final supplementary.

**Dr. Swann:** A final supplemental. Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I'll try the Minister of Finance, former agriculture minister. Will the Finance minister act to press this government to protect our agriculture industry's reputation and enact workplace health and safety with child labour standards in industrial farming operations? When will this government take action?

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

**Mr. Hancock:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. That would actually fall into the Human Services portfolio. I can assure the hon. member, as I have before, that I am working very closely with the minister of agriculture in terms of how we work with the agriculture industry sector, not the family farms so much because we do have to make the distinction about how people live in their own homes. The agriculture industry is important, and we do need to work with respect to safety standards. We do need to be certain that we not only have educational programs in place and industrial programs in place putting safety first but that we also look at what

legislation might be effective to ensure safety for our agriculture industry workers.

**The Speaker:** Thank you.

Now the hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, followed by Innisfail-Sylvan Lake.

### Judicial Inquiry into Health Services

**Ms Notley:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. When allegations of queue-jumping first emerged, the NDP asked the RCMP to investigate, but they could find no evidence of wrongdoing. Now with every witness so far unable to recall names, it looks like the government is spending \$10 million on an inquiry so that Albertans can be told the same thing once again. To the Minister of Health: will he admit that this inquiry is merely a costly bait-and-switch tactic to avoid a judicial inquiry into political interference and doctor intimidation in our health care system?

**Mr. Lukaszuk:** Mr. Speaker, first of all, before going any further, let's deal with facts. The inquiry, as I understand, didn't remember the names because the Leader of the Official Opposition came up as the only name that is in any way related to this matter.

**Mr. Anderson:** Point of order.

**Mr. Lukaszuk:** Let me remind this House that about a year ago every member of the opposition was rising and asking the Premier for an independent judicial inquiry on queue-jumping. This inquiry is taking place. It is independent. We will not interfere with it, and I believe that they should be left to their own devices so they can proceed independently.

**The Speaker:** The point of order by Airdrie at 2:26 has been noted. Let's proceed with the supplemental, please.

**Ms Notley:** Well, Mr. Speaker. Given that the president of the AMA lambasted the terms of reference of the queue-jumping inquiry as too narrow to properly get at the issue of physician intimidation, will the minister admit that this inquiry is merely an expensive and cynical issue management strategy designed to ask the wrong questions and elicit irrelevant answers so that the Premier can once again wriggle out of a promise, in this case the one to call a public inquiry into physician intimidation?

**Mr. Lukaszuk:** Mr. Speaker, I'd just like to clarify my first answer. I must apologize to the Leader of the Official Opposition. The name that I understand has been remembered and the only name remembered is the leader of the Liberal opposition.

**The Speaker:** Final supplementary, no preamble. You have the floor, Edmonton-Strathcona.

**Ms Notley:** Given that the queue-jumping inquiry is more evidence of yet another broken promise by the Premier and given the apparent inability of the inquiry to get any of its witnesses to name names, government member names, let alone talk about the widespread physician intimidation found by the Health Quality Council, will the minister finally do the right thing, stop plastering over the truth, and call an inquiry into the real issue of physician intimidation?

**Mr. Horne:** Mr. Speaker, the Premier of this province promised an inquiry into allegations of queue-jumping in our health care system, and that's exactly what she's delivered. The hon. member can stand and editorialize on the inquiry that is currently under

way. As the hon. Deputy Premier has indicated, this is an independent process. As we have pointed out on this side of the House during the fall session, we intend to let that process proceed independently. If the hon. member has concerns about the way the commissioner is conducting the inquiry, I suggest she take them up with him.

Thank you.

**The Speaker:** The hon. Member for Innisfail-Sylvan Lake, followed by Edmonton-Ellerslie.

### Physician Services Agreement

**Mrs. Towle:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. When the health inquiry was announced last spring, many made note of its narrow terms of reference. The Wildrose has been calling on the government to include the issue of physician intimidation, to no avail. Now a new issue seems to be cropping up. Last night the Minister of Health gave an interview where he seemed to blame the doctors for the problems we're currently seeing and righteously denounced their personal attacks against him. I guess we had it wrong. Apparently, it's the Minister of Health who has been victimized by a culture of fear. Recognizing this, I'd like to ask the minister: when will you expand the scope of the inquiry to include the emerging issue of government intimidation by doctors?

**Mr. Horne:** Mr. Speaker, sometimes you just don't know where to begin. What I will say to the hon. member is in reference to the interview last night and also with reference to the very articulate member's statement by the hon. Member for Calgary-Mountain View. The opinion I expressed last night was that I believe that the Alberta Medical Association and this government have much in common in terms of our agreement on the issues that need to be addressed. We have further agreed that a facilitator, a third-party facilitator, would benefit us greatly in restarting these discussions. I think the question that everyone should be asking is: why are we not at the table?

**The Speaker:** The hon. member.

**Mrs. Towle:** A mediator. Hmm.

Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Given the cloud of fear the minister lives under with ongoing bullying of the government, I can understand his fear. To the Associate Minister of AT and T: when will he start holding doctors accountable for their continued efforts to hold this government accountable?

**Mr. Horne:** Mr. Speaker, I can attest that neither of us is afraid to stand up and answer the hon. member's question.

The fact of the matter is that we have a situation in Alberta where our physicians have been without an agreement for over 20 months. I want to assure the House that this government is as concerned about that on the part of physicians as we are with respect to patients in Alberta and our health system generally. We have much in common with the Alberta Medical Association in terms of the issues that they want to address, and we're willing and available at any time to resume those negotiations, perhaps with the benefit of a third-party facilitator.

2:30

**Mrs. Towle:** Given that, in all seriousness, the deteriorating relationship between this government and the physicians of our province has many Albertans concerned and given that the Minister of Health is clearly on the mend after the barrage of attacks and criticisms, will the government's master of diplomacy, the

Premier's right-hand man, the Deputy Premier, be able to find time in his busy ministerial schedule to step in and settle this dispute?

**Mr. Horne:** Mr. Speaker, I can assure the hon. member that all members of this government and the government caucus take the issue that we do not have an agreement with the Alberta Medical Association most seriously. All efforts have been made in an attempt to get an agreement. As hon. members opposite have referred to, we have had not only one but two agreements in principle with the Alberta Medical Association over the last 20 months.

Mr. Speaker, the issues in health care are complex. The Alberta Medical Association has an important role in representing physicians in negotiation matters. The government of Alberta has a responsibility to represent the interests of all Albertans, including physicians, and we will do so in resolving this.

**The Speaker:** The hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie, followed by Calgary-Shaw.

### Affordable Supportive Living Program

**Mr. Bhardwaj:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. A surplus school site in my constituency is in the initial review stages for consideration to be transformed into a long-term care facility. A nonprofit group has been working with the city of Edmonton to help develop this facility. This is indeed welcome news as we have more and more seniors every day in our province that require government support. All of my questions are to the Associate Minister of Seniors. Given the fiscal realities in our province what funding is available for Edmonton area development of long-term care facilities?

**Mr. VanderBurg:** Well, Mr. Speaker, I want to thank the member for his continued effort to represent his constituency and the needs of seniors in the Edmonton area. I'll tell you that each day I work with Alberta Health to determine the hot spots, we'll call it, in Alberta where we need to identify projects. Whether they be in opposition ridings or in Edmonton ridings or in Whitecourt ridings, we need to identify our efforts where the need is based. I can tell you that last year we had 13 projects based all across the province. I'll get on to that later.

**The Speaker:** The hon. member.

**Mr. Bhardwaj:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. To the same minister: given our already strained support system for seniors how will the minister continue to ensure that Alberta seniors in need of long-term care are taken care of?

**Mr. VanderBurg:** Again, Mr. Speaker, we have identified in our five-year plan that we're going to build over 5,000 units in this province. Already, two years into the program, 2,100 have been built. I make a commitment that we'll meet our commitment of 1,000 this upcoming year. We have \$25 million in the budget. On an ongoing basis we have three years committed, \$25 million each year.

I can tell the member that just in the last round Edmonton All Seniors Care, 60 units were funded; the Beit Horim—Our Parents' Home, 55 units; in Medicine Hat, in the opposition ridings, Park Place Seniors, 80 units; Medicine Hat again, CORE Association, 10 units.

**The Speaker:** The hon. member.

**Mr. Bhardwaj:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. My final question to the same minister is a bit more specific. Mr. Minister, how many ASLI units were funded in the Edmonton and capital region area?

**Mr. VanderBurg:** Well, Mr. Speaker, I can tell you that our 5,000 goal is on target. Whether it be in Edmonton, whether it be in Calgary, whether it be in Medicine Hat or St. Paul or Smoky Lake, wherever the need is, where Alberta Health Services identifies a need, that's where we'll put our resources.

**The Speaker:** The hon. Member for Calgary-Shaw, followed by Calgary-Hawkwood.

### Awesome Questions

**Mr. Wilson:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I think we can all agree that it's been a long session, and I can honestly say that those of us on this side of the House have learned a lot. Particularly helpful have been the deep, probing questions posed to this government by its own members. Indeed, we on this side of the House have been inspired by the tone and tenor of these PC backbenchers over the last six weeks, so much so that I'm going to take a page out of their book. To the Minister of Energy . . .

**Some Hon. Members:** Why are you so awesome? [laughter]

**The Speaker:** Like all of you, I'm just dying to hear the answer. However, let's be reminded of the rules. Questions ought not seek opinion. But we did allow one new member some leeway; we'll allow this one as well.

Let's hear your answer, hon. minister.

**Mr. Hughes:** Mr. Speaker, the 13th Prime Minister of Canada, the Rt. Hon. John George Diefenbaker, was fond of pointing out that when you're hunting big game, don't get distracted by rabbit tracks. This government has been hunting big game for Albertans. We've been building the province, we're building the future, we're building relationships, and they would have us all chase rabbit tracks.

**The Speaker:** While the Speaker can't possibly imagine the supplemental, I'd be most anxious to know if you have one, Calgary-Shaw.

**Mr. Wilson:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. To the minister formerly known as Doctor No or, for those not familiar with the hon. member's past, the Transportation minister: given that you have showered money and gifts all over our great province in the form of roads, bridges, and interchanges and every Albertan should be grateful for those gifts . . .

**Some Hon. Members:** Why are you so awesome? [laughter]

**The Speaker:** You know, if I allow it once, I have to allow it again.

**Mr. McIver:** Well, Mr. Speaker, I couldn't possibly live up to what just happened, but I do remember an advertisement for a game when I was young, and the answer to the question was: it's in the wrist action. Mr. Speaker, I think that would be a good place to stop.

**The Speaker:** Hon. member, did you have a final supplemental?

**Mr. Wilson:** I do, Mr. Speaker. Thank you. Finally, to the Deputy Premier. Don't worry; we haven't forgotten about you. As someone who has been dealt a somewhat unfortunate follicle hand and

has to sit across from you daily and be taunted by your proverbial royal flush . . .

**Some Hon. Members:** Why is your hair so awesome? [laughter]

**Mr. Lukaszuk:** Mr. Speaker, it is so awesome because it rises every time I hear questions coming from the other side. It rises every time I realize that taxpayers actually are paying their salary for this. It rises knowing that all these members on this side are working for Albertans. They're trying to build hospitals, schools, seniors' homes, and are working for aboriginal communities, and this is what they're getting from Her Majesty's Misguided Opposition.

Thank you.

**The Speaker:** A bit of levity is always welcome, hon. members, and we've had our fair share. Let's hope that the public shares in that fair share equally. I was prompted to almost rule that as a personal attack, but fortunately I did not.

The hon. Member for Calgary-Hawkwood.

**Mr. Luan:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. It is very hard following that, but I can appreciate that a little bit of humour in our House can bring us together.

### Long-term and Continuing Care for Seniors

**Mr. Luan:** I do have a very pertinent question that my constituency has been asking for a while, and I'm very happy to have a chance to bring it up today. This is in regard to continuing care for seniors. As we all know, baby boomers reached their retirement age last year, and we can reasonably predict that in the coming years the demand for seniors' services, in particular nursing care, will be very, very high. To the Associate Minister of Seniors: what is the government of Alberta's strategic response to this surging social need?

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

**Mr. VanderBurg:** Well, thank you, Mr. Speaker. I want to thank the Member for Calgary-Hawkwood for standing up for the seniors in his constituency and working so hard for the people of Calgary. Yes, he's right. You know, there are a lot of us that are going to turn 65 in the next number of years. Every 15 minutes an Albertan turns 65, and it's kind of interesting that every day someone turns a hundred in this province. We're finally starting to age. We will be guided by our continuing care strategy, and part of this strategy is investing in our communities.

2:40

**The Speaker:** The hon. member.

**Mr. Luan:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. My first supplemental question is specifically related to one of my communities, Silver Springs. It's a well-established community of over 30 years. People living in this kind of community are familiar to the community. They've lived there for over 30 years. However, their needs change, and when they need nursing care, as we stand now, they have to move a far distance – most of the time it's in suburban areas – to get into nursing care. To the same associate minister: what is the government of Alberta doing to help established communities like this one so seniors do not have to move?

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

**Mr. VanderBurg:** Well, thank you, Mr. Speaker. One of the programs that we're going to be announcing shortly is the ASLI program. We will target, as I talked about earlier, parts of this province that are most in need as identified by Alberta Health Services. I can tell you that the Calgary area is in need. You know, just in this last go-round of the ASLI grants in Calgary the AgeCare health services in Walden Heights received funding for 77 units; the Chinese Christian home association, 25 units; the Calgary Golden Life association, 100 units; the Calgary Intercare Corporate Group, 24. And we need to do more, sir.

**The Speaker:** The hon. member.

**Mr. Luan:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. My last supplemental question is to the hon. Minister of Finance. I understand that building such community infrastructure costs money and takes time, but seniors in my community don't have the luxury to wait another 15, 20 years before this happens. To the minister: can you help me to help my constituency and answer how you're going to finance such community development facilities?

**Mr. Horner:** Well, Mr. Speaker, this is part and parcel of what we've been talking about in the House pretty much this session. We do intend to bring forward a capital plan that will be fully funded, and we look forward to building the infrastructure that Albertans need today, as the hon. member has suggested, not defer it out into the future, where it'll probably cost more.

**Mr. Anderson:** Point of order, Mr. Speaker.

**The Speaker:** Thank you.

Hon. members, Airdrie has risen on a point of order at 2:43. It has been noted.

Time has run out on question period. However, the rules do provide for clarity to be expressed, and the Minister of Finance and President of Treasury Board has requested an opportunity to make that clarification, which will enable the Leader of Her Majesty's Loyal Opposition to pose another question and then for that minister to give an answer to that new question.

Hon. President of Treasury Board, please proceed.

#### **Details of Meetings with Katz Group Inc.**

*(continued)*

**Mr. Horner:** Well, thank you, Mr. Speaker. Earlier today the question of the hon. Leader of the Official Opposition was: on what date did I meet with the Katz Group this year, in 2012? My office, listening attentively to question period, has advised me that the meeting date was July 17 at 9 a.m.\*

I would also add, Mr. Speaker, that I have met with Edmonton city officials on numerous occasions about a possible large recreational-cultural infrastructure within the city as well as, frankly, with proponents of similar type structures in Calgary.

**The Speaker:** The hon. Leader of Her Majesty's Loyal Opposition.

**Ms Smith:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Again to the Finance minister: who was it, and were they registered as a lobbyist in the lobbyists registry?

**Mr. Horner:** I'm not a lawyer, Mr. Speaker, but as I understand the requirements for registering in the lobbyists registry, you would have to be registered as a lobbyist and doing a hundred hours or something like this. This was actually Mr. Katz himself, who happens to be the owner of the company in question. He

doesn't do lobbying as a profession, so he doesn't necessarily need to be registered as a lobbyist as I understand it.

We had one meeting. The answer was no before the meeting. The answer was no when we left the meeting, Mr. Speaker.

**The Speaker:** Hon. members, before we proceed with Members' Statements, might we please have unanimous consent to revert to the introduction of guests. We have two.

[Unanimous consent granted]

#### **Introduction of Guests**

*(continued)*

**The Speaker:** The hon. Member for Vermilion-Lloydminster, followed by Edmonton-Centre.

**Dr. Starke:** Mr. Speaker, thank you. It's my pleasure today to introduce to you and through you to all members of the Assembly four individuals who are particularly interested in the introduction of Bill 206, who I hope are here today. I'd like to introduce Janis Seville and Barb Borkent of the Lung Association of Alberta, Vikki Pym for the Campaign for a Smoke-Free Alberta, and also Les Hagen, Action on Smoking & Health. These individuals have worked tirelessly for the promotion of health in Alberta, and I am pleased that they are able to join us. I would ask them to rise and receive the warm welcome of the Assembly.

**The Speaker:** The hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre.

**Ms Blakeman:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker, and to all of my colleagues in the House. It doesn't happen very often that we lose some information, and given the amount of paperwork we all deal with here, that is truly a miracle. But somewhere in the transition we lost the information about the group that I had in earlier. I promised I would read their introduction into the record if you would be so kind as to allow me to. We had with us today 13 people from the Careers in Transition program. They were all GED students. They came with their teacher, Tanis Harder. They did watch most of question period with great interest and had all kinds of questions when I ran out and caught them. So would you please warmly welcome my group in absentia.

**The Speaker:** Thank you.

The next order of business is Members' Statements, and in 20 seconds we will start with Calgary-Fort.

#### **Members' Statements**

*(continued)*

**The Speaker:** The hon. Member for Calgary-Fort.

#### **Christmas Greetings**

**Mr. Cao:** Well, thank you, Mr. Speaker. On the occasion of the coming Christmas and new year, I would like to bring best wishes from my constituents to all members of our Assembly and also to bring warm greetings from our Assembly to my constituents. I wish all of you and your families an abundance of blessings, good health, and happiness.

Mr. Speaker, my thanks go to each member of my election campaign team, volunteers, friends, and voters who have helped to renew my constituency contract for the fifth time. Most of all, I am very pleased that the collective wisdom of Albertans has prevailed in choosing the stability and continuity of a strong government with its reliable long record of great achievements

\*See page 1342, left column, paragraph 6

that will continue with the new administration and leadership. During the current global economic turmoil our government provides Albertans with stability, security, sound leadership, and progressive plans for growth.

On a personal note, along with my wife, Kim, I was promoted to the rank of grandparent of the first order by little Dylan and then grandparent of the second order by little Maxwell. I'm elated and extremely proud that I have been given this great promotion. As a grandparent I certainly can speak for seniors, and I am also a strong advocate for Alberta's youth as they are my grandchildren's future.

Looking ahead, I'm confident that the global economy will soon pick up more strongly. Our government has continuously placed Alberta in a much better position than any other jurisdiction. Only by working together and by focusing on things that really matter can we bring Alberta to the world and take on any challenges from our global competitors.

Mr. Speaker, as an additional note, the coming year is also the lunar Year of the Snake, and the snake is a good omen for full harvest.

I wish every Albertan Merry Christmas, Happy New Year, and a smooth slide to success in the Year of the Snake.

**The Speaker:** The Leader of Her Majesty's Loyal Opposition.

#### Fall Session Comparative Statistics

**Ms Smith:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Yesterday in this House the Member for Calgary-South East gave an inspired address to MLAs about the last time he checked. He said, "The last time I checked, Albertans expected us to debate policy in this House." And he's right. But we have some doubts about the last time he checked on that particular point because the last time I checked, I found a few interesting facts.

During the fall session a total of 843,503 words were spoken in this Assembly during bill debate. And the last time I checked, about 132,000 of those words were spoken by PC members of this Assembly, and over 513,000 words were spoken by the Official Opposition. Mr. Speaker, the last time I checked, that means Wildrose MLAs carried 61 per cent of the debate in this Legislature while the PC MLAs carried a paltry 16 per cent.

2:50

Now, if we assume that people were speaking at a rate of 150 words per minute, that means Wildrose MLAs debated legislation for 57 hours, Mr. Speaker. The PCs: 14 hours. So while the Member for Calgary-South East is right that we are expected to debate policy in this House, the last time I checked, it's painfully clear which side of the House is meeting that expectation.

But let's keep on going, Mr. Speaker, because the last time I checked, I rose 249 times to speak in debate in this Legislature during this fall session. My colleague from Airdrie rose 192 times. My colleague from Rimbey-Rocky Mountain House-Sundre rose 189 times. In contrast, the associate ministers of Health and Finance, presumably members that should have a lot to say, rose 6 and 7 times respectively, and the Member for Calgary-Cross, well, didn't say a single word all session. I think we know what Lynden Dorval would say about that.

The last time I checked, the Wildrose Official Opposition is leading the way on debating policy.

**The Speaker:** The hon. Member for Calgary-Glenmore.

#### Calgary Cultural Achievements

**Ms L. Johnson:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I rise with my member's statement on behalf of Calgary, the cultural capital of Canada for the year 2012. It was particularly fitting as several of the city's cultural cornerstones are marking their centennials this year, including the Calgary Stampede, the Calgary public library, and the Pumphouse and Grand theatres. From the city's earliest days Calgary has been recognized for its unique combination of geography, people, and traditions.

Converting this honour into action happened as a result of partnerships between the federal government, the city of Calgary, and the government of Alberta. The collaborative nature of the celebration extends to the operational side. Calgary 2012 is co-chaired by the Calgary Arts Development Authority and the Calgary Stampede, with partnership from the city of Calgary recreation, Calgary public library, Tourism Calgary, and Calgary Economic Development.

Calgary 2012 has showcased Calgary's culture and will create legacy projects to encourage future achievements. These activities include an artist-in-residence program, a national and international cultural exchange program, the creation of a municipal cultural plan, and a mass participation in lip dub that occurred during the fifth annual Alberta Culture Days in September.

I am proud the government of Alberta helps support Calgary's cultural scene, and I thank the minister for her support as well.

Author Chris Turner, a Calgarian not by birth but by choice, wrote in the June issue of *The Walrus* magazine that: "Calgary is a city whose best stories haven't been told too many times . . . it's a city whose best stories maybe haven't even been written yet." Those stories will be told, Mr. Speaker, through the formal completion of Calgary's cultural capital celebrations in March 2013. The positive effects will be felt for years to come within Calgary and throughout Alberta.

Thank you.

#### Presenting Reports by Standing and Special Committees

**The Speaker:** Hon. members, it's my pleasure to table with the Assembly today five copies of the report of the Special Standing Committee on Members' Services entitled Review of Compensation of Members of the Legislative Assembly of Alberta dated December 2012 in my capacity as chair of that committee. I want to thank all members of this all-party committee and inform you that copies of this final report are going to be delivered to you immediately as I sit down after tabling it.

Thank you, all.

#### Introduction of Bills

##### Bill 206

#### Tobacco Reduction (Flavoured Tobacco Products) Amendment Act, 2012

**Dr. Starke:** Mr. Speaker, I request leave to introduce a bill being the Tobacco Reduction (Flavoured Tobacco Products) Amendment Act, 2012.

Mr. Speaker, just by way of a very brief introduction, it's my pleasure to introduce this as a private member's bill on behalf of a group of high school students in Lloydminster who conducted a province-wide campaign to engage their colleagues and their peers in trying to improve the health of all Albertans.

I look forward to the debate on this bill, which is entirely in keeping with our government's tobacco reduction strategy which was recently announced by the Minister of Health.

Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

[Motion carried; Bill 206 read a first time]

### Tabling Returns and Reports

**The Speaker:** The hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre, followed by the Associate Minister of Finance.

**Ms Blakeman:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. I have three tablings to do, two on behalf of colleagues. The first is a transcript that gives the facts on Randa Wheaton and her decision to, as a Christmas present for her friend, buy him an extra shower, just to confirm that that's what was quoted correctly. That tabling was from the leader of the Liberal opposition.

The next tabling is on behalf of my colleague for Calgary-Mountain View. These are the tablings from which he quoted during his question in QP on McDonald's Restaurants of Canada I think not wishing to pay children. But don't quote me on that.

The final tabling that I have, Mr. Speaker, is the appropriate number of copies of a really good examination of how taxes, fees, and licensing is breaking down in Alberta between urban municipalities and counties and districts. It's well worth a very careful read. I shall certainly be doing that over the break and be coming back with lots of suggestions based on this.

Thank you.

**The Speaker:** The hon. Associate Minister of Finance, followed by the President of Treasury Board.

**Mr. Fawcett:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I'm tabling the required number of copies of a document that I referred to in an exchange with the leader of the Liberal opposition. It's a candidate financial statement for the Liberal candidate in the Calgary-Klein riding, where he accepted over \$25,000 of in-kind contributions, three of which were well over the \$2,000 limit: one for \$8,782.65; one for \$5,440; and one for \$10,000.

Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

**The Speaker:** Are there others? I'm sorry. The President of Treasury Board. I got four notes at once here. Carry on.

**Mr. Horner:** Mr. Speaker, I don't table very often, but today I felt the need. I want to table a couple of documents given that this is probably our last day in the session. The first one, with the required number of copies, is a letter from Lethbridge College, signed by the chair. I won't read the letter, but it's about:

The Board discussed the option of long-term financing of long-lived capital assets and unanimously supported such a move by the government . . . A planned approach ensures that critical assets such as [theirs and others] move forward when needed while reducing the financial risk and ultimately improving the investment return made by the Province.

The second one, Mr. Speaker, is a release today by the Consulting Engineers of Alberta, where they are very pleased to hear that "the Alberta Government is undertaking a strategy of sustainable infrastructure investment. It is the healthiest approach for Alberta and will ensure our province's long-term [stability]." They state: "We believe disciplined borrowing makes sense if it means pay a little now or a whole lot later."

**The Speaker:** Hon. Government House Leader, you did catch my attention when you glanced up at the clock. Did you wish to address the hour and the Routine?

**Mr. Hancock:** Yes, Mr. Speaker. In the event there are more tablings, I would certainly ask for the consent of the House to extend the Routine.

**The Speaker:** Hon. members, does anyone object to unanimous consent being given to conclude the Routine for today?

[Unanimous consent granted]

### Tablings to the Clerk

**The Clerk:** I wish to advise the House that the following document was deposited with the office of the Clerk: on behalf of the hon. Mr. Hughes, Minister of Energy, a report entitled Responsible Actions: A Plan for Alberta's Oil Sands progress report 2011 prepared by the Alberta government.

### Projected Government Business

**Mr. Anderson:** Pursuant to the standing orders we're very excited to learn what business we'll have to work on next week. Let us know, please.

**The Speaker:** The hon. Government House Leader.

**Mr. Hancock:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I can advise the hon. member that I likely will be making a motion pursuant to the standing orders in about a minute. Therefore, there will not be a next week, at least this fall.

3:00

**The Speaker:** Hon. members, let us then proceed with the points of order. I have one at 2:04 p.m. from the hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre, who will undoubtedly begin with her citation. Proceed, hon. member.

### Point of Order

#### Explanation of Speaker's Ruling

**Ms Blakeman:** Indeed. Under our House Standing Order 13(2), that "the Speaker shall explain the reasons for any decision on the request of a Member," I have two requests. The first is on his reference to page 510. Now, the remarks that the leader of the Liberal opposition had said in his third question were: please, Premier, afford me the dignity of answering my question. My question to the Speaker and my request is if he could explain his ruling, which called upon: "Members may not insist on an answer." Now, given the tone and the actual words that were chosen for that, I'm curious as to what the member said that would make the Speaker believe that it was an insistence.

**The Speaker:** Hon. member, thank you.

Is there anyone from the government side that is interested? No.

This is to me. I am pleased to provide some clarification, hon. member. I don't have the Blues at hand yet. However, I did quote *House of Commons Procedure and Practice* page 510, chapter 11. I believe what I said was the following quote, which I'll read in a moment, and then I said: hon. members are encouraged to read onward or words to that effect. It's actually the second line that I probably should have read because it would have probably avoided the point of clarification.

Nonetheless, on page 510, chapter 11 in the *House of Commons Procedure and Practice* it states:

Members may not insist on an answer nor may a Member insist that a specific Minister respond to his or her question. A Minister's refusal to answer a question may not be questioned or treated as the subject of a point of order or question of privilege.

However, anticipating where that was going, there seemed to be just a little bit of disorder that followed right after that because the person to whom the question had been directed chose to have someone else from the front row answer it. So I thought I would try and prevent any further disruption by reminding people of that rule.

That is the clarity under which I offered that particular comment, and I believe it was helpful at the time. I would ask hon. members to please read further on. I won't take up any more time right now.

Let's move on to the next point, please. At 2:10 I have again Edmonton-Centre. You raised another point of order?

**Ms Blakeman:** So you cautioned my member in advance of something happening later. Okay. I've got that one, I think.

#### Point of Order

##### Questions to Members Other than Ministers

**Ms Blakeman:** I'll refer the Speaker to page 492, please. There was a question from this side directly to the Government House Leader, and I note on page 491 under chapter 11, Questions, that the very first sentence says, "The right to seek information from the Ministry of the day and the right to hold that Ministry accountable are recognized as two of the fundamental principles of parliamentary government." It goes on to talk about how important this is, but what I'm picking up is the word "ministry."

The Government House Leader, as precious as he is to each of us, is not – there is no ministry of Government House Leader, so I'm wondering why the Speaker allowed the question to proceed. He did caution and break in at one point but then allowed all of the questions to proceed. So I'm curious as to – it's clearly laid out here – why he cautioned the member and then allowed all three questions to proceed. Could he explain that decision under 13(2), please?

**The Speaker:** So it's not a point of order? Just a point of clarification is what you're actually seeking? Just so I'm clear.

**Ms Blakeman:** The point of order is the use of the citation 13(2), which says, "The Speaker shall explain the reasons for any decision on the request of a Member." This member is requesting that you explain why, when it doesn't allow for questions to be asked of government other than to a ministry or to a member representing a ministry or to the Premier, the Speaker allowed a question directed to the Government House Leader to proceed through all three questions.

**The Speaker:** I'm sorry. So you're asking me to clarify a point here. I'd be happy to do that. I think you're referring to the question that was asked by Barrhead-Morinville-Westlock? Is that the exchange, to be clear?

**Ms Blakeman:** Yes. Correct.

**The Speaker:** We don't have all the Blues at all, hon. member. It's Thursday, and as you know, we're not able to . . . [interjection] Thank you. That's correct. You're nodding. I appreciate that.

I think I said – and if I didn't, let me say it again – that over this fall session there have been a number of occasions where I have risen and either clarified things or reminded members of rules or admonished some in some cases. In other instances I also commented at some length that there are a lot of new members who are using this particular session as a learning session. I shouldn't say that they're using it; it's just turning out that way.

There are thousands of pages of rules and decorum and so on that we are asked to abide by and adhere to, and the Speaker has been quite lenient, I think, in my opinion at least, in allowing new members some of that leeway. Now, I've allowed that leeway for three of the four parties, who actually have new members. In the case of the Liberal opposition you do not have any new members, so I wasn't able to extend the same courtesy, perhaps, if you had expected it somewhere. But I did extend it to all other members, and I've received a lot of, shall I say, complimentary phone calls and some nice notes saying: thank you for letting us do that.

In this particular case I could have and should have at the time reminded Barrhead-Morinville-Westlock that questions in question period not only ought to seek information and hold the government to account, but they must also not be hypothetical, and they must not seek opinion. On that point, I would uphold where you were coming from, hon. member.

I'm going to read that into the record now, and it has been read into the record. I won't get into the citations involved, but there are citations to that effect, as you would know. That will conclude that matter.

Now we have: at 2:15 the Member for Airdrie rose on a point of order. Please proceed with your point.

#### Point of Order

##### Tabling Cited Documents

**Mr. Anderson:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. This will be very brief. The Deputy Premier – and he did clarify it in a subsequent answer. Of course, this would be 23(h), (i), and (j). He specifically stated that somehow the Official Opposition leader was involved in asking the government for a person to interfere with the queue-jumping or to allow for queue-jumping in the system. The Deputy Premier did clarify that subsequently, but I want it on the record that, of course, the Official Opposition leader was not elected at that time and had nothing to do with that. That's been withdrawn, I believe, and I think it's been dealt with on the record.

The other one is section 37 of the standing orders. Obviously, when we read things in this House and when we quote things in this House, we table them. The Associate Minister of Seniors in an answer to a question specifically was reading off of a document a list of different facts, figures, projects, and so forth. If he could table that list, that would be good. I would ask you to ask him to table those.

**The Speaker:** Hon. member, you are quite correct. Members are encouraged actually to not quote extensively from documents, but when they do comment and quote briefly from a document, the expectation, of course, is that it will be tabled. I'll allow the hon. associate minister to comment or the Government House Leader to comment, one of you.

**Mr. Hancock:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I would just note that the question was raised under Standing Order 37, and Standing Order 37 does not in fact say that at all. Standing Order 37 says that "five copies must be tabled of a return, report or other paper required to be laid before the Assembly in accordance with an Act or with any resolution or Standing Order of the Assembly." It's a

facilitating standing order, which requires tablings to be in proper form, et cetera. It says nothing about a minister answering a question and referring to notes while doing so.

**The Speaker:** That is a very correct reference. I've just looked it up myself because I didn't recall it there. But the point that I'm making is that when members do quote from documents, there is an expectation in other citations, which I just don't have at hand, that they will be tabled.

Hon. associate minister, I'll recognize you now.

**Mr. VanderBurg:** The first opportunity I have, I'll make five copies and table it for the House. In the meantime I'll give it to the member, too. It's public information.

**The Speaker:** Thank you very much.

3:10

**Mr. Hancock:** Mr. Speaker, just a point of clarification on that. The reason why I made the comment, the interjection – because I had no idea whether the hon. member wanted to table it or not. But as members might know, there would be briefing binders that people have, and it would not be, even if one happened to refer to a briefing binder, in my submission, in order to require the tabling of the binder or a briefing note that was being consulted as part of answering a question.

**The Speaker:** Thank you very much.

I've just received a note here. For reference purposes I'm looking at the sixth edition of *Beauchesne's Parliamentary Rules*

& *Forms*. I know members are interested in the educational process that occurs here. I can recall being a first-time member myself and being overwhelmed at the time by how many rules there are. I would refer you to read *Beauchesne* 495 under the headline Documents Cited. It explains the process there. It's rather lengthy, so I won't go through it all, but suffice it to say that it's clearly spelled out here. We'll leave it to the hon. associate minister to figure out how he wants to handle it from there, and that will conclude this matter for today.

### Orders of the Day

**The Speaker:** Hon. members, the Government House Leader rose earlier and indicated that there was no further business as such to be brought forward at this time, so I'll recognize the hon. Government House Leader.

**Mr. Hancock:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Pursuant to Standing Order 3(4)(b) it is my privilege to advise the House that there is no further government business to be dealt with in the fall session, so I would now move that the Assembly adjourn.

**The Speaker:** Hon. members, yes, it's been an interesting session.

The hon. Government House Leader has advised that there is no further government business and has moved that the Assembly do now adjourn.

[Motion carried; the Assembly adjourned at 3:12 p.m. pursuant to Standing Order 3(4)(b)]



## **Bill Status Report for the 28th Legislature - 1st Session (2012)**

**Activity to December 06, 2012**

The Bill sponsor's name is in brackets following the Bill title. If it is a money Bill, (\$) will appear between the title and the sponsor's name. Numbers following each Reading refer to Hansard pages where the text of debates is found; dates for each Reading are in brackets following the page numbers. Bills numbered 1 to 199 are Government Bills. Bills numbered 200 or higher are Private Members' Public Bills. Bills numbered with a "Pr" prefix are Private Bills.

\*An asterisk beside a Bill number indicates an amendment was passed to that Bill; the Committee line shows the precise date of the amendment.

The date a Bill comes into force is indicated in square brackets after the date of Royal Assent. If a Bill comes into force "on proclamation," "with exceptions," or "on various dates," please contact Legislative Counsel, Alberta Justice, for details at (780) 427-2217. The chapter number assigned to the Bill is entered immediately following the date the Bill comes into force. SA indicates Statutes of Alberta; this is followed by the year in which it is included in the statutes, and its chapter number. Please note, Private Bills are not assigned chapter numbers until the conclusion of the Fall Sitings.

### **1\* Workers' Compensation Amendment Act, 2012 (Redford)**

First Reading -- 8 (May 24 aft., passed)

Second Reading -- 177 (Oct. 23 eve.), 193-96 (Oct. 23 eve.), 233 (Oct. 24 eve., passed)

Committee of the Whole -- 336-39 (Oct. 29 eve.), 354-71 (Oct. 30 aft.), 373-80 (Oct. 30 eve., passed with amendments)

Third Reading -- 476-84 (Nov. 1 aft., passed on division)

### **2\* Responsible Energy Development Act (Hughes)**

First Reading -- 207 (Oct. 24 aft., passed)

Second Reading -- 263 (Oct. 25 aft.), 424-43 (Oct. 31 aft.), 445-57 (Oct. 31 eve.), 526-46 (Nov. 5 eve., passed)

Committee of the Whole -- 563-71 (Nov. 6 aft.), 593 (Nov. 6 eve.), 644-48 (Nov. 7 aft.), 649-69 (Nov. 7 eve.), 731-53 (Nov. 19 eve.), 777-94 (Nov. 20 aft.), 795-853 (Nov. 20 eve.), 902-05 (Nov. 20 eve., passed on division, with amendments)

Third Reading -- 921-41 (Nov. 21 aft., passed on division)

### **3\* Education Act (J. Johnson)**

First Reading -- 155 (Oct. 23 aft., passed)

Second Reading -- 219-31 (Oct. 24 aft.), 238 (Oct. 24 eve., passed)

Committee of the Whole -- 380-407 (Oct. 30 eve., passed with amendments)

Third Reading -- 669 (Nov. 7 eve.), 688-94 (Nov. 8 aft.), 753-63 (Nov. 19 eve., passed on division)

### **4 Public Interest Disclosure (Whistleblower Protection) Act (Scott)**

First Reading -- 352-53 (Oct. 30 aft., passed)

Second Reading -- 423-24 (Oct. 31 aft.), 593-614 (Nov. 6 eve.), 627-44 (Nov. 7 aft., passed on division)

Committee of the Whole -- 975-80 (Nov. 22 aft.), 1057-74 (Nov. 27 aft.), 1075-101 (Nov. 27 eve.), 1127-137 (Nov. 28 aft.), 1139-161 (Nov. 28 eve., passed)

Third Reading -- 1161-166 (Nov. 28 eve., passed on division)

### **5 New Home Buyer Protection Act (Griffiths)**

First Reading -- 261 (Oct. 25 aft., passed)

Second Reading -- 354 (Oct. 30 aft.), 457-59 (Oct. 31 eve., passed)

Committee of the Whole -- 546-49 (Nov. 5 eve.), 571-83 (Nov. 6 aft.), 585-93 (Nov. 6 eve., passed)

Third Reading -- 853-55 (Nov. 20 eve., passed)

### **6 Protection and Compliance Statutes Amendment Act, 2012 (Jeneroux)**

First Reading -- 155 (Oct. 23 aft., passed)

Second Reading -- 209 (Oct. 24 aft.), 264 (Oct. 25 aft., passed)

Committee of the Whole -- 459-62 (Oct. 31 eve., passed)

Third Reading -- 855-56 (Nov. 20 eve., passed)

### **7\* Election Accountability Amendment Act, 2012 (Denis)**

First Reading -- 774 (Nov. 20 aft., passed)

Second Reading -- 972-75 (Nov. 22 aft.), 1015-41 (Nov. 26 eve., passed)

Committee of the Whole -- 1166-167 (Nov. 28 eve.), 1191-92 (Nov. 29 aft.), 1221-43 (Dec. 3 eve.), 1261-79 (Dec. 4 aft.), 1281-1300 (Dec. 4 eve., passed, with amendments)

Third Reading -- 1315-37 (Dec. 5 aft., passed on division)

- 8      Electric Utilities Amendment Act, 2012 (Hughes)**  
First Reading -- 156 (Oct. 23 aft., passed)  
Second Reading -- 233 (Oct. 24 eve.), 316-36 (Oct. 29 eve, passed)  
Committee of the Whole -- 857-902 (Nov. 20 eve.), 943-53 (Nov. 21 eve., passed)  
Third Reading -- 953-56 (Nov. 21 eve., passed)
- 9      Alberta Corporate Tax Amendment Act, 2012 (\$) (Horner)**  
First Reading -- 156 (Oct. 23 aft., passed)  
Second Reading -- 209-10 (Oct. 24 aft.), 272 (Oct. 25 aft.), 311-16 (Oct. 29 eve., passed)  
Committee of the Whole -- 462 (Oct. 31 eve., passed)  
Third Reading -- 856-57 (Nov. 20 eve., passed)
- 10     Employment Pension Plans Act (Kennedy-Glans)**  
First Reading -- 261 (Oct. 25 aft., passed)  
Second Reading -- 521-26 (Nov. 5 eve., passed)  
Committee of the Whole -- 668-69 (Nov. 7 eve., passed)  
Third Reading -- 857 (Nov. 20 eve., passed)
- 201\*   Scrap Metal Dealers and Recyclers Identification Act (Quest)**  
First Reading -- 92 (May 30 aft., passed)  
Second Reading -- 291-301 (Oct. 29 aft., passed)  
Committee of the Whole -- 716-22 (Nov. 19 aft., adjourned, amendments introduced and agreed to)
- 202     Public Lands (Grasslands Preservation) Amendment Act, 2012 (Brown)**  
First Reading -- 130 (May 31 aft., passed)  
Second Reading -- 501-13 (Nov. 5 aft., adjourned)
- 203     Employment Standards (Compassionate Care Leave) Amendment Act, 2012 (Jeneroux)**  
First Reading -- 473 (Nov. 1 aft., passed)
- 204     Irlen Syndrome Testing Act (Jablonski)**  
First Reading -- 968 (Nov. 22 aft., passed)
- 205     Fisheries (Alberta) Amendment Act, 2012 (Calahasen)**  
First Reading -- 1117 (Nov. 28 aft., passed)
- 206     Tobacco Reduction (Flavoured Tobacco Products) Amendment Act, 2012 (Starke)**  
First Reading -- 1350-51 (Dec. 6 aft., passed)
- 208     Seniors' Advocate Act (Towle)**  
First Reading -- 1315 (Dec. 5 aft., passed)

## Table of Contents

Prayers .....	1339
Introduction of Guests .....	1339, 1349
Members' Statements	
Personal Code of Conduct .....	1340
Physician Services Agreement .....	1340
FireSmart Funding .....	1340
Christmas Greetings .....	1349
Fall Session Comparative Statistics .....	1350
Calgary Cultural Achievements .....	1350
Oral Question Period	
Tobacco Recovery Lawsuit .....	1341
Details of Meetings with Katz Group Inc .....	1341, 1349
Opposition Amendments to Bills .....	1342
Personal Care Standards in Seniors' Facilities .....	1342
Donations to Political Parties .....	1343
Travel and Expense Reporting .....	1344
Fall Session Accomplishments .....	1344
Justice System .....	1345
Results-based Budgeting Review .....	1345
Child Labour Standards .....	1345
Judicial Inquiry into Health Services .....	1346
Physician Services Agreement .....	1347
Affordable Supportive Living Program .....	1347
Awesome Questions .....	1348
Long-term and Continuing Care for Seniors .....	1348
Presenting Reports by Standing and Special Committees .....	1350
Introduction of Bills	
Bill 206, Tobacco Reduction (Flavoured Tobacco Products) Amendment Act, 2012 .....	1350
Tabling Returns and Reports .....	1351
Tablings to the Clerk .....	1351
Projected Government Business .....	1351
Orders of the Day .....	1353

If your address is incorrect, please clip on the dotted line, make any changes, and return to the address listed below. To facilitate the update, please attach the last mailing label along with your account number.

Subscriptions  
Legislative Assembly Office  
1001 Legislature Annex  
9718 – 107 Street  
EDMONTON, AB T5K 1E4

---

Last mailing label:

Account # \_\_\_\_\_

New information:

Name:

Address:

---

Subscription information:

Annual subscriptions to the paper copy of *Alberta Hansard* (including annual index) are \$127.50 including GST if mailed once a week or \$94.92 including GST if picked up at the subscription address below or if mailed through the provincial government interdepartmental mail system. Bound volumes are \$121.70 including GST if mailed. Cheques should be made payable to the Minister of Finance.

Price per issue is \$0.75 including GST.

Online access to *Alberta Hansard* is available through the Internet at [www.assembly.ab.ca](http://www.assembly.ab.ca)

Subscription inquiries:

Subscriptions  
Legislative Assembly Office  
1001 Legislature Annex  
9718 – 107 St.  
EDMONTON, AB T5K 1E4  
Telephone: 780.427.1302

Other inquiries:

Managing Editor  
*Alberta Hansard*  
1001 Legislature Annex  
9718 – 107 St.  
EDMONTON, AB T5K 1E4  
Telephone: 780.427.1875