



Province of Alberta

The 29th Legislature  
Third Session

# Alberta Hansard

Wednesday afternoon, April 5, 2017

Day 16

The Honourable Robert E. Wanner, Speaker

## Legislative Assembly of Alberta

### The 29th Legislature

Third Session

Wanner, Hon. Robert E., Medicine Hat (ND), Speaker

Jabbour, Deborah C., Peace River (ND), Deputy Speaker and Chair of Committees

Sweet, Heather, Edmonton-Manning (ND), Deputy Chair of Committees

Aheer, Leela Sharon, Chestermere-Rocky View (W)  
Anderson, Hon. Shaye, Leduc-Beaumont (ND)  
Anderson, Wayne, Highwood (W)  
Babcock, Erin D., Stony Plain (ND)  
Barnes, Drew, Cypress-Medicine Hat (W)  
Bilous, Hon. Deron, Edmonton-Beverly-Clareview (ND),  
Deputy Government House Leader  
Carlier, Hon. Oneil, Whitecourt-St. Anne (ND),  
Deputy Government House Leader  
Carson, Jonathon, Edmonton-Meadowlark (ND)  
Ceci, Hon. Joe, Calgary-Fort (ND)  
Clark, Greg, Calgary-Elbow (AP)  
Connolly, Michael R.D., Calgary-Hawkwood (ND)  
Coolahan, Craig, Calgary-Klein (ND)  
Cooper, Nathan, Olds-Didsbury-Three Hills (W),  
Official Opposition House Leader  
Cortes-Vargas, Estefania, Strathcona-Sherwood Park (ND),  
Government Whip  
Cyr, Scott J., Bonnyville-Cold Lake (W)  
Dach, Lorne, Edmonton-McClung (ND)  
Dang, Thomas, Edmonton-South West (ND)  
Drever, Deborah, Calgary-Bow (ND)  
Drysdale, Wayne, Grande Prairie-Wapiti (PC),  
Progressive Conservative Opposition Whip  
Eggen, Hon. David, Edmonton-Calder (ND)  
Ellis, Mike, Calgary-West (PC)  
Feehan, Hon. Richard, Edmonton-Rutherford (ND)  
Fildebrandt, Derek Gerhard, Strathmore-Brooks (W)  
Fitzpatrick, Maria M., Lethbridge-East (ND)  
Fraser, Rick, Calgary-South East (PC)  
Ganley, Hon. Kathleen T., Calgary-Buffalo (ND)  
Gill, Prab, Calgary-Greenway (PC)  
Goehring, Nicole, Edmonton-Castle Downs (ND)  
Gotfried, Richard, Calgary-Fish Creek (PC)  
Gray, Hon. Christina, Edmonton-Mill Woods (ND)  
Hanson, David B., Lac La Biche-St. Paul-Two Hills (W),  
Official Opposition Deputy House Leader  
Hinkley, Bruce, Wetaskiwin-Camrose (ND)  
Hoffman, Hon. Sarah, Edmonton-Glenora (ND)  
Horne, Trevor A.R., Spruce Grove-St. Albert (ND)  
Hunter, Grant R., Cardston-Taber-Warner (W)  
Jansen, Sandra, Calgary-North West (ND)  
Jean, Brian Michael, QC, Fort McMurray-Conklin (W),  
Leader of the Official Opposition  
Kazim, Anam, Calgary-Glenmore (ND)  
Kleinsteuber, Jamie, Calgary-Northern Hills (ND)  
Larivee, Hon. Danielle, Lesser Slave Lake (ND)  
Littlewood, Jessica, Fort Saskatchewan-Vegreville (ND)  
Loewen, Todd, Grande Prairie-Smoky (W)

Loyola, Rod, Edmonton-Ellerslie (ND)  
Luff, Robyn, Calgary-East (ND)  
MacIntyre, Donald, Innisfail-Sylvan Lake (W)  
Malkinson, Brian, Calgary-Currie (ND)  
Mason, Hon. Brian, Edmonton-Highlands-Norwood (ND),  
Government House Leader  
McCuaig-Boyd, Hon. Margaret,  
Dunvegan-Central Peace-Notley (ND)  
McIver, Ric, Calgary-Hays (PC),  
Leader of the Progressive Conservative Opposition  
McKittrick, Annie, Sherwood Park (ND)  
McLean, Hon. Stephanie V., Calgary-Varsity (ND)  
McPherson, Karen M., Calgary-Mackay-Nose Hill (ND)  
Miller, Barb, Red Deer-South (ND)  
Miranda, Hon. Ricardo, Calgary-Cross (ND)  
Nielsen, Christian E., Edmonton-Decore (ND)  
Nixon, Jason, Rimbey-Rocky Mountain House-Sundre (W),  
Official Opposition Whip  
Notley, Hon. Rachel, Edmonton-Strathcona (ND),  
Premier  
Orr, Ronald, Lacombe-Ponoka (W)  
Panda, Prasad, Calgary-Foothills (W)  
Payne, Hon. Brandy, Calgary-Acadia (ND)  
Phillips, Hon. Shannon, Lethbridge-West (ND)  
Piquette, Colin, Athabasca-Sturgeon-Redwater (ND)  
Pitt, Angela D., Airdrie (W),  
Official Opposition Deputy Whip  
Renaud, Marie F., St. Albert (ND)  
Rodney, Dave, Calgary-Lougheed (PC),  
Progressive Conservative Opposition House Leader  
Rosendahl, Eric, West Yellowhead (ND)  
Sabir, Hon. Irfan, Calgary-McCall (ND)  
Schmidt, Hon. Marlin, Edmonton-Gold Bar (ND)  
Schneider, David A., Little Bow (W)  
Schreiner, Kim, Red Deer-North (ND)  
Shepherd, David, Edmonton-Centre (ND)  
Sigurdson, Hon. Lori, Edmonton-Riverview (ND)  
Smith, Mark W., Drayton Valley-Devon (W)  
Starke, Dr. Richard, Vermilion-Lloydminster (PC)  
Stier, Pat, Livingstone-Macleod (W)  
Strankman, Rick, Drumheller-Stettler (W)  
Sucha, Graham, Calgary-Shaw (ND)  
Swann, Dr. David, Calgary-Mountain View (AL)  
Taylor, Wes, Battle River-Wainwright (W)  
Turner, Dr. A. Robert, Edmonton-Whitemud (ND)  
van Dijken, Glenn, Barrhead-Morinville-Westlock (W)  
Westhead, Cameron, Banff-Cochrane (ND),  
Deputy Government Whip  
Woollard, Denise, Edmonton-Mill Creek (ND)  
Yao, Tany, Fort McMurray-Wood Buffalo (W)

#### Party standings:

New Democrat: 55

Wildrose: 22

Progressive Conservative: 8

Alberta Liberal: 1

Alberta Party: 1

#### Officers and Officials of the Legislative Assembly

Robert H. Reynolds, QC, Clerk

Shannon Dean, Law Clerk and Director of House  
Services

Trafton Koenig, Parliamentary Counsel

Stephanie LeBlanc, Parliamentary Counsel and  
Legal Research Officer

Philip Massolin, Manager of Research and  
Committee Services

Nancy Robert, Research Officer

Janet Schwegel, Managing Editor of

*Alberta Hansard*

Brian G. Hodgson, Sergeant-at-Arms

Chris Caughell, Deputy Sergeant-at-Arms

Paul Link, Assistant Sergeant-at-Arms

Gareth Scott, Assistant Sergeant-at-Arms

## **Executive Council**

|                       |  |
|-----------------------|--|
| Rachel Notley         | Premier, President of Executive Council  |
| Sarah Hoffman         | Deputy Premier, Minister of Health   |
| Shaye Anderson        | Minister of Municipal Affairs  |
| Deron Bilous          | Minister of Economic Development and Trade   |
| Oneil Carlier         | Minister of Agriculture and Forestry   |
| Joe Ceci              | President of Treasury Board and Minister of Finance                                      |
| David Eggen           | Minister of Education  |
| Richard Feehan        | Minister of Indigenous Relations   |
| Kathleen T. Ganley    | Minister of Justice and Solicitor General  |
| Christina Gray        | Minister of Labour,<br>Minister Responsible for Democratic Renewal                       |
| Danielle Larivee      | Minister of Children's Services  |
| Brian Mason           | Minister of Infrastructure,<br>Minister of Transportation                                |
| Margaret McCuaig-Boyd | Minister of Energy   |
| Stephanie V. McLean   | Minister of Service Alberta,<br>Minister of Status of Women                              |
| Ricardo Miranda       | Minister of Culture and Tourism  |
| Brandy Payne          | Associate Minister of Health   |
| Shannon Phillips      | Minister of Environment and Parks,<br>Minister Responsible for the Climate Change Office |
| Irfan Sabir           | Minister of Community and Social Services  |
| Marlin Schmidt        | Minister of Advanced Education   |
| Lori Sigurdson        | Minister of Seniors and Housing  |

**STANDING AND SPECIAL COMMITTEES OF THE LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF ALBERTA**

**Standing Committee on the Alberta Heritage Savings Trust Fund**

Chair: Mr. Coolahan  
Deputy Chair: Mrs. Schreiner

|       |           |
|-------|-----------|
| Cyr   | McKitrick |
| Dang  | Taylor    |
| Ellis | Turner    |
| Horne |           |

**Standing Committee on Alberta's Economic Future**

Chair: Mr. Sucha  
Deputy Chair: Mr. van Dijken

|             |           |
|-------------|-----------|
| Carson      | McPherson |
| Connolly    | Orr       |
| Coolahan    | Piquette  |
| Dach        | Schneider |
| Drysdale    | Schreiner |
| Fitzpatrick | Taylor    |
| Gotfried    |           |

**Standing Committee on Families and Communities**

Chair: Ms Goehring  
Deputy Chair: Mr. Smith

|           |          |
|-----------|----------|
| Aheer     | Miller   |
| Drever    | Pitt     |
| Hinkley   | Rodney   |
| Horne     | Shepherd |
| Jansen    | Swann    |
| Luff      | Yao      |
| McKitrick |          |

**Standing Committee on Legislative Offices**

Chair: Mr. Shepherd  
Deputy Chair: Mr. Malkinson

|              |            |
|--------------|------------|
| Drever       | Nixon      |
| Ellis        | Pitt       |
| Horne        | van Dijken |
| Kleinsteuber | Woollard   |
| Littlewood   |            |

**Special Standing Committee on Members' Services**

Chair: Mr. Wanner  
Deputy Chair: Cortes-Vargas

|         |           |
|---------|-----------|
| Cooper  | Nixon     |
| Dang    | Orr       |
| Jabbour | Piquette  |
| Luff    | Schreiner |
| McIver  |           |

**Select Special Ombudsman and Public Interest Commissioner Search Committee**

Chair: Mr. Shepherd  
Deputy Chair: Mr. Malkinson

|              |            |
|--------------|------------|
| Ellis        | Pitt       |
| Horne        | van Dijken |
| Kleinsteuber | Woollard   |
| Littlewood   |            |

**Standing Committee on Private Bills**

Chair: Ms McPherson  
Deputy Chair: Connolly

|              |              |
|--------------|--------------|
| Anderson, W. | Kleinsteuber |
| Babcock      | McKitrick    |
| Drever       | Rosendahl    |
| Drysdale     | Stier        |
| Fraser       | Strankman    |
| Hinkley      | Sucha        |
| Kazim        |              |

**Standing Committee on Privileges and Elections, Standing Orders and Printing**

Chair: Ms Fitzpatrick  
Deputy Chair: Ms Babcock

|          |            |
|----------|------------|
| Carson   | Loyola     |
| Coolahan | McPherson  |
| Cooper   | Nielsen    |
| Ellis    | Schneider  |
| Goehring | Starke     |
| Hanson   | van Dijken |
| Kazim    |            |

**Standing Committee on Public Accounts**

Chair: Mr. Cyr  
Deputy Chair: Mr. Dach

|             |           |
|-------------|-----------|
| Barnes      | Malkinson |
| Fildebrandt | Miller    |
| Fraser      | Panda     |
| Goehring    | Renaud    |
| Gotfried    | Turner    |
| Littlewood  | Westhead  |
| Luff        |           |

**Standing Committee on Resource Stewardship**

Chair: Loyola  
Deputy Chair: Mr. Hunter

|              |           |
|--------------|-----------|
| Babcock      | Loewen    |
| Clark        | MacIntyre |
| Dang         | Malkinson |
| Drysdale     | Nielsen   |
| Hanson       | Rosendahl |
| Kazim        | Woollard  |
| Kleinsteuber |           |

## Legislative Assembly of Alberta

1:30 p.m.

Wednesday, April 5, 2017

[The Speaker in the chair]

### Prayers

**The Speaker:** Good afternoon.

Let us pray or reflect, each in our own way. Let us share a sense of pride for the work we do, particularly when we reach unanimous agreements in this Assembly. Let us acknowledge our responsibilities and our commitment to the communities we represent, to our province, and to our nation.

Please be seated.

### Introduction of Guests

**The Speaker:** The hon. Member for Airdrie.

**Mrs. Pitt:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. It's an honour to rise today and introduce to you and through you to all members of this Assembly the parents, staff, and students of C.W. Perry. This is the second of three groups from this school. There are almost 600 grade 6 students in the school. As I mentioned earlier, Airdrie is the fifth-largest school district in the province, just outside of Edmonton and Calgary, and we grow at an annual rate of about 5 per cent, which is about two schools every year needed to keep up with growth. I just should point out that we only got one in this year's budget. I would like to introduce first the teachers and then the parents. Please rise as I call your name: Ms Tracey Bishop, Mr. Steven Prediger, Mr. Carlin Olynyk, Mrs. Heather Nikkel, Mrs. Regina Dollimount, Jonathan Wiersma, Miranda Harbourne. Will the students rise as well. Please receive the traditional warm welcome of this House.

**The Speaker:** Welcome.

The hon. Member for Peace River.

**Ms Jabbour:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I am really thrilled today to introduce to you and through you Ridgeview central school students. These are truly an amazing group of young people. They travelled on the bus eight hours from La Crête to get here, and not one of them said: are we there yet? I would like to introduce Mr. Fred Kirby, Lana Halladay, Chris Fehr, Dorothy Unrau, Barry Neufeld, Andrew Doerksen, Willy Schellenberg, Willie Friesen, and a special mention to Henry Harder – he's the bus driver, and he's back at the hotel, resting up for the return home – and the rest of the class from Ridgeview school. Please stand and accept the warm traditional welcome of this Assembly.

**The Speaker:** Welcome.

Are there any other school groups, hon. members?

The hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie.

**Loyola:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I would like to introduce to you and through you to the members of the Assembly constituents of mine who are also family members of one of our current pages, Jordyn Reed. Seated in the Speaker's gallery are Tracey and Kelly Neufeld, Jordyn's parents, as well as her younger sister Kaeleigh. Tracey is a lab technician at J. Percy Page, and Kelly is an architectural technologist, who has designed many homes in and around Edmonton. Kaeleigh is interested in learning more about what Jordyn does here as a page, and they are here in the Speaker's gallery today to watch Jordyn in her role, a position she has held

since the autumn of 2015. I would ask them to please rise and receive the traditional warm welcome of this Assembly.

**The Speaker:** Welcome. Welcome to you. We're particularly proud, all of us collectively, of the work that the pages do every day in this place. They're much more rational and competent than me. [interjection] I won't say anything else about the other members here in the House.

The hon. Member for Innisfail-Sylvan Lake.

**Mr. MacIntyre:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I would like to introduce to you and through you to the members of this Assembly two constituents of mine who are also here to watch Jordyn Reed in her role as a page. Sue and Rudy Neufeld, Jordyn's grandparents, are both retired. They enjoy skiing, square dancing, and travelling. Sue and Rudy are seated in the Speaker's gallery with Jordyn's other family members, and I would ask them to please rise and receive the traditional warm welcome of this Assembly.

**The Speaker:** Welcome, and thank you.

The Minister of Infrastructure and of Transportation.

**Mr. Mason:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. It's my pleasure to introduce to you and through you to all members of the Assembly two people who have been instrumental in providing services to my constituents in Edmonton-Highlands-Norwood. Edmonton-Highlands-Norwood presents some very, very difficult cases from time to time.

**Mr. Cooper:** That's just you.

**Mr. Mason:** Besides me.

Both of these staff people have done an outstanding job. Donna Forbes is a part-time constituency assistant in my office. She is just completing her master's of social work degree at the University of Calgary and previously worked for six years in the Victoria, B.C., constituency offices of MLA Carole James and MP Denise Savoie.

Kali Gregg is studying social work at MacEwan University and has been a practicum student in my office since last September. She'll be going on to work on her bachelor's degree in social work this fall, and we all wish her the very best in her future pursuits.

I would ask them to please rise now and accept the warm welcome of the Assembly.

**The Speaker:** Welcome. You must be very patient people.

The hon. Member for Edmonton-Castle Downs.

**Ms Goehring:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. It is an absolute privilege today to introduce to you and through you to all members of this House two of my favourite people in the world: my beautiful mother, Lorraine McQuiggin, and my oldest son, Allan. I'm so excited that you're here with us today. My mom has just recently retired, so it's such an honour to have her join us. My son is a fourth-year generation insulator who's also an alumni of NAIT. Thank you both for all of your love and support. I would not be here without you.

**The Speaker:** Welcome.

The hon. Member for Athabasca-Sturgeon-Redwater.

**Mr. Piquette:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I would like to introduce to you and through you to all members of the Assembly Kelly Lynn Spafford, program manager for the community action for healthy relationships network. She is also an indefatigable community volunteer and a real asset to Athabasca and area. I would ask that she now rise and receive the traditional warm welcome of the Assembly.

**The Speaker:** Welcome.

The hon. Minister of Environment and Parks.

**Ms Phillips:** Well, thank you, Mr. Speaker. I am pleased to rise to introduce to you and through you to all members of the Assembly Mr. Tim Shum and Mr. Andrew Shum. Tim is a member of the Alberta public service, and Andrew is a registered nurse working for AHS. Tim and Andrew – if they may rise – are celebrating their adult interdependent partnership today. My new friends have chosen us to celebrate their day with. Please join me in giving Tim and Andrew the traditional warm welcome of the Assembly and a hearty congratulations on their new life together.

**The Speaker:** Welcome.

### Members' Statements

#### Olds College Gala

**Mr. Strankman:** Recently it was my privilege to attend along with many of my Wildrose colleagues the Olds College gala. Every year members of our caucus proudly support this worthy agricultural event. One of the highlights of this gala is the live auction of a steer, cut and wrapped through the meat-cutting course offered by Olds College. My colleagues and I were fortunate enough to pool our resources together, winning the bid. We enjoyed our opportunity immensely.

**1:40**

The absolute peak of this evening had to be the generous donation of \$16 million by Alberta entrepreneur, oil field industry leader, and dedicated philanthropist David P. Werklund and his partner, Sue Norman. This gift is historically unprecedented and is the largest ever personal donation to an Alberta college or technical institution. Their generosity begins with an initial \$2 million cash donation, followed up by \$4 million in a matching component. Finally, in order to ensure this great institution's sustainability, he has provided for \$10 million as a gift from his estate. This donation will result in the creation of the Werklund agriculture institute, which will specialize in smart agriculture. This institute will engage students, researchers, and industry in smart and sustainable agriculture and agribusiness solutions.

Mr. Speaker, David Werklund is known on this side of the Chamber. David grew up in the same area as my colleague from Grande Prairie-Smoky. In fact, my colleague's family owns and operates farmland in the area David grew up in. David's ties to agriculture and the energy sector span many years and stretch across all of our beautiful province. In fact, his cousin farms just down the road from my farm.

I tried unsuccessfully to convince David and Sue to attend here today so that we could formally recognize and acknowledge this significant act of generosity, but true to form they quietly declined with a smile.

### Government Achievements

**Mr. Shepherd:** Mr. Speaker, I'm proud to serve with a government that keeps its promises. In two years we've fulfilled 73 per cent of our 2015 election platform, with another 15 per cent in process: a royalty review within six months, with implementation in a year, leading to a 50 per cent increase in rig activity; increasing the minimum wage to \$15 an hour by 2018; working to diversify our economy; banning corporate and union donations to political parties; extending the sunshine list to agencies, boards, and commissions; reversing cuts to health care, education, and children's

support services; providing stable, predictable funding for health services, school boards, postsecondaries, and municipalities; repairing hospitals and seniors' facilities across Alberta; eliminating fee increases proposed by the third party, including a regressive health care levy; returning Alberta to a reasonable, progressive tax system.

We're funding schools for enrolment and building new ones where they're needed, not for political gain; freezing tuition; restoring the summer temporary employment program; reducing school fees for essential services and transportation; phasing in targeted school lunch programs for elementary students; investing in child care capped at \$25 a day; improving the Alberta family employment tax credit and introducing the Alberta child benefit; creating a Ministry of Status of Women; reviewing employment standards to support family-friendly workplaces; creating more spaces in women's shelters.

We're also leading on climate change by crafting solutions with stakeholders, other provinces, and the federal government; phasing out coal-fired electricity; establishing an energy efficiency strategy and green retrofit program; protecting the Castle wildlife area; repealing the Aboriginal Consultation Levy Act; working with federal and indigenous governments to resolve land claims; ensuring that indigenous communities have access to safe, clean drinking water; improving representation of indigenous culture and history in our schools.

Meanwhile our opposition promises to cut billions out of infrastructure and public services, repeal the carbon levy that enabled crucial pipeline access to tidewater, and break both the letter and the spirit of legislation protecting LGBTQ students.

Mr. Speaker, I think I'll stand with our promises and our commitment to make life better for Albertans.

### Government Policies

**Mr. Gotfried:** Mr. Speaker, a segue to reality. Let me set the scene. A cold December in 2018 at the end of another long hard year, a cat is meowing in the background, and the family is gathered, fretting over the overdraft on their bank statement, their maxed-out credit card bill, and a foreclosure letter on their home of 23 years. Mother Raquel, a coal industry administrator, has been unemployed for over two years, and the family has been surviving on Father Joseph's modest salary of \$45,000. Even with sacrifices and austerity household expenses for the family of five exceed \$55,000 per year, and the kids have had to give up hockey, ringette, and dance. EI has run out, RRSPs are spent, RESPs are cashed in, and there is little equity left in the house. Normalcy has left this once vibrant home. The family is buried in unserviceable debt, and utilities have been cut off twice due to unpaid bills.

Then the phone rings. The caller ID says it's from Ontario.

"This is Ecofitt. I'm calling to inform you that we will be installing your free light bulbs next week."

"Free light bulbs? Well, that sounds interesting, but we won't be here."

"Well, that's unfortunate. Can we book another time?"

"We won't be here. We are facing eviction and bankruptcy. We will likely be at a shelter or maybe moving back to Saskatchewan, where we hope to find work and start over. We just can't survive here any longer with our expenses exceeding our income. We can't even afford to pay the interest anymore. We never thought it would come to this."

"So you won't be needing light bulbs and thermostats?"

"You're not listening to me. We won't have any lamps or even a furnace, let alone a home. They're of no use to me if I can't afford a roof over my head. They're of no use to me when I have to use

my credit card to put food on the table. They're of no use to us when we can't even support our family."

Mr. Speaker, these are the stories we hear every day as a result of the decimation of the Alberta advantage.

**The Speaker:** The hon. Member for Athabasca-Sturgeon-Redwater.

### Family and Gender-based Violence

**Mr. Piquette:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I'm proud to be part of a government that works hard to make life better for all Albertans. Recently we passed legislation that helps to address family violence by making it easier for victims to get out of leases to remove themselves from dangerous situations. This session we've also brought forward Bill 2. If passed, this bill would remove barriers for victims of domestic and sexual violence who want to pursue civil action.

So much of this work in combating family violence would not be possible without the expertise and dedication of nonprofit agencies. In Athabasca and surrounding regions the Athabasca and Area Prevention of Relationship Abuse Action Committee and their partners, Healthy Families Healthy Futures and Community Action for Healthy Relationships, play an absolutely critical role in this. These organizations have been essential in our community, providing support services to people struggling with relationship abuse, family violence, and gender-based violence. Their expertise is particularly valuable in rural areas, where it can be difficult to access these services and where there is a high demand.

Not only do these organizations provide outstanding front-line supports, but they contribute to the community through outreach and education. The events they hold to raise funds also raise awareness. I myself have been pleased, though it might be a strong word, to participate in the Walk a Mile in Her Shoes event in Athabasca, held annually. I was also honoured to be a sponsor and attend the first production ever of *The Vagina Monologues* in Athabasca, with all proceeds going to this organization. This was a spectacularly successful volunteer production and a complete sellout.

Our government is proud to support organizations such as these with stable grant funding. Unfortunately, despite the great work being done to address family violence and gender-based violence in our communities, it remains an ongoing and grave issue, and we will continue to work with them to make life better for those at risk from such violence.

Thank you.

**The Speaker:** Thank you.

The hon. Member for Calgary-Shaw.

### Samuel W. Shaw Middle School

**Mr. Sucha:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Like all MLAs, I carry a strong amount of pride for all the schools in my riding, but I've been amazed by the work I have seen from a particular one, Samuel W. Shaw middle school.

Last fall I had the opportunity to attend the opening ceremonies of the 2016 Junior High Leadership Conference. With the theme Spark: Ignite. Catch Fire, the school held a successful conference for over 500 student delegates and teacher advisers from all over the province. Congratulations to student executive directors Jim Qi, Jasper Hollings, McKenna Olson, Alex Sinik, Lianna Dennis, Anna Hambrook, and Christine Changoor, who helped bring this conference to a CBE school for the first time. A strong credit also needs to be given to the leadership group at Samuel Shaw school as it is no small feat to host such a large event.

Mr. Speaker, while I was leaving, I was proud to see a poster for its inaugural GSA, showing the strong leadership that the school has demonstrated.

Not to be outdone, last month Samuel Shaw held another successful drive through its Shave Your Lid for a Kid, that united people from all around the community, not just the school. Students and teachers shaved their heads, many inspired by people in their lives impacted by cancer, including Heather Farrell, who shaved her head in memory of a student who passed away two years ago. When it was all said and done, Samuel Shaw raised just over \$19,000 towards Kids Cancer Care. Thank you to teacher Phill Noel, who enthusiastically put on this event.

Mr. Speaker, as I have said, I am proud of Samuel Shaw middle school in Calgary-Shaw as just one example of the goodwill of my constituents, who are, like this government, working to make life better for Albertans.

Thank you.

1:50

### Oral Question Period

**The Speaker:** The Leader of the Official Opposition.

### Labour Legislation Review

**Mr. Jean:** Yesterday I asked the Premier questions about the labour legislation review. Her answers were anything but forthcoming and certainly didn't provide comfort to concerned workers and business owners who are facing so much uncertainty in Alberta right now. Our economy is already hurting, and we've seen enough strife in the labour movement here. All signs point to the NDP hoping for more unionization as a result of this review. Does the Premier seriously think that more unionization will encourage investment and jobs in Alberta?

**The Speaker:** The hon. Premier.

**Ms Notley:** Well, thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. I can certainly understand why people in Alberta would be concerned about issues of uncertainty given that the member opposite can't take a position or keep a position for more than three or four hours at a time. However, on this side we know exactly what we're doing, and what we are doing is engaging in a consultation on employment standards, family-friendly employment standards levels and labour legislation review, something that hasn't been reviewed since Roger Rabbit was in the theatres. What we are doing is moving forward to engage in a meaningful consultation . . .

**An Hon. Member:** Time.

**Ms Notley:** . . . to modernize our labour legislation to actually . . .

**The Speaker:** Thank you, hon. Premier.

Just to the House, remember that the time – I really rely on these people. They tell me when it's time, so there is no need to mention "time." It's being looked after here.

**Mr. Jean:** Albertans want stability on the jobs front, not more uncertainty.

Yesterday the Premier said that she'll look at other provinces and – what? – she'll pick from them her favourite labour practices to put in place here in Alberta. Well, that clearly opens the door for the elimination of secret ballot votes for union certification in favour of a union-friendly card-check process. Removing secret ballots would eliminate the workers' right to anonymously vote on whether to unionize away from union leader pressure. The Premier

needs to be clear. Is she intending to do away with the secret ballot for certification? Yes or no?

**Ms Notley:** Well, you know, Mr. Speaker, I did in fact answer this question yesterday, but I can understand that the member opposite might, because of his own experience, think that it's important to check positions every day to see if we still have the same position. But I will say that I still have the same position, and that position is that we are consulting with Albertans on this issue. We will review the outcome of that consultation, and then we will have a discussion on how we proceed to go forward in this Legislature if that should be the plan.

**Mr. Jean:** When she looks at labour legislation in other provinces, I hope the Premier realizes that half the country has already rejected card check in favour of secret ballots.

She could however learn from our neighbours on how to properly consult on these changes. After Bill 6, I think, she could use a lesson. In 2014 Ontario began reviewing labour legislation. Guess what? It's 2017, and they're still consulting, something unique for this government. In Alberta the NDP plan is to consult for a month on these changes. Since the Premier is looking across the country, will she now pump the brakes and allow two years, which is reasonable, for this labour review?

**The Speaker:** Thank you.

**Ms Notley:** Well, you know, Mr. Speaker, I understand that given the member opposite's demonstrated inability to reach and keep a decision, dithering is a way to go. However, that is not what we are going to do. What we are going to do is that we are going to consult. We're going to consult with parties on all sides, understanding that there are key issues that people are fully aware of and have been consulted on year after year after year even though no change has been made for decades. We are then going to move forward after fully considering all sides because that is what Albertans elected us to do.

**Mr. Jean:** So no consultation, Mr. Speaker.

**The Speaker:** Second main question.

### Carbon Levy Costs and Energy Efficiency Programs

**Mr. Jean:** Life under the carbon tax means higher costs for seniors' facilities, for social housing, and for other nonprofits. New documents from Wildrose show the repeated attempts late last year by housing management boards, town councillors, and nonprofits to find out how in the world they are supposed to deal with the rising costs of the carbon tax, a tax which will continue to actually cost Albertans more every single year under this NDP government. The answer from the minister: get more energy efficient. Come on. It's shameful. How is taking millions of dollars from seniors and homeless shelters doing anything but making life far worse for Albertans?

**The Speaker:** Thank you.

**Ms Notley:** Well, Mr. Speaker, I'm sure the member opposite would be happy to know that a significant portion of people who received the rebate in January from the carbon levy was, in fact, seniors because in many cases seniors are lower and middle-income people. In fact, seniors are ahead of the game right now. Moreover, our minister is moving forward to work with businesses and nonprofits in terms of how they can especially focus on increasing

their efficiency and reducing their energy use, and that will be good for all Albertans.

**Mr. Jean:** According to these documents seniors are being charged an extra \$120 per year, Mr. Speaker, as a result just of the carbon tax. That number could rise to up to \$300 under this NDP government's plan. What's the carbon tax paying for? Well, a sweetheart deal for an Ontario renewable company. Today the minister confirmed that Ecofitt wasn't the lowest bidder or even the second-lowest bidder for their free light bulb program. How unique. The disrespect this government shows for the hard-earned dollars of vulnerable seniors is shameful. Will the Premier explain to Albertans why the NDP ignored the best deals for the taxpayers and chose to go with . . .

**The Speaker:** Thank you, hon. member.

The Minister of Environment and Parks.

**Ms Phillips:** Well, thank you, Mr. Speaker. Of course, the lowest bids were ones that were found to be incomplete. I'm not surprised that the Official Opposition, the Wildrose, would prefer that we move forward with no energy efficiency program given that they do not want to save Albertans \$112 per year, which is what the direct install residential program will save Albertans. They do not want to create jobs. They want to fire those 70 people that have been hired to deliver that program, and they want to make sure that we're not helping Calgary move forward as we put the energy efficiency agency in that city.

**The Speaker:** Thank you, hon. minister.

**Mr. Jean:** I agree with an energy efficiency program, Mr. Speaker. I can't think of anything better than an efficiency program to get rid of the NDP.

The CEO of the Kerby Centre, a Calgary organization dedicated to helping older adults and seniors, has said that he expects that the carbon tax will be devastating to nonprofits in Alberta. Charities, nonprofits, and seniors' groups are struggling because of this Premier's carbon tax. Seniors need to be able to afford to pay for a roof over their heads. They're not interested in free light bulbs. Can the Premier please explain how taxing seniors to pay for inflated contracts for out-of-province energy companies helps to make life more affordable for our province's most vulnerable?

**Ms Notley:** Well, Mr. Speaker, just a few days ago the member opposite was tearing down our energy efficiency program, saying that he was absolutely opposed to it and absolutely opposed to the \$112 a year that the average Albertan would save as a result of that. Now, apparently, he thinks that \$112 per year is something that's really important, and we agree. The member opposite, again, changes his position more often than someone attending yoga classes in my riding. We just can't keep up. [interjections]

**The Speaker:** The hon. Member for Innisfail-Sylvan Lake.

Order. Quiet, please.

### Electric Power System

**Mr. MacIntyre:** On Monday the Premier made it clear that she doesn't know how much the PPA debacle is costing Albertans: well, direct borrowing for the Balancing Pool, \$2 billion; \$151 million from the PPA settlements gone; the 2016 balance that the Balancing Pool had to liquidate, \$705 million, gone; an added consumer charge paid for by ratepayers, \$260 million, and \$1 billion



plus in consumer credit, all gone. Why is this Premier pursuing a course that will cost Albertans over \$4 billion?

**Ms Notley:** Well, you know, Mr. Speaker, I appreciate that the members opposite would not necessarily be familiar with this, but sometimes when you are faced with a very difficult situation that you inherited, you have to make a series of tough decisions. Now, I appreciate that the member opposite is struggling a bit with the issue of decision-making. However, we are not. We knew that when we came in, we had an electricity system that was in the process of melting down and that we had to take action to protect consumers, to protect investors, to protect Alberta industry, and that's exactly what we did.

**Mr. MacIntyre:** Bad PPA policies will cost Albertans more than \$4 billion. That is more revenue than the carbon tax is expected to generate.

The bad decisions that led us to this point started in the spring of 2015. Just weeks after being elected, the NDP made a decision without consultation to increase the carbon tax on Alberta's electricity generators, resulting in the mass cancellation of PPAs and this hefty \$4 billion in losses. The cost benefit? Albertans would have saved money if the old heavy emitters carbon tax had never been touched. Why won't the Premier roll back this terrible policy?

2:00

**Ms Notley:** Mr. Speaker, our government's plan to move forward with pricing carbon in Alberta is directly linked to our successful acquisition of not one but two – two – pipelines, something that, as I've said before, the members opposite, when working together with their cousins in Ottawa, simply couldn't make happen. Sometimes change is tough, but that's what leadership looks like. We are leading the country, we are leading the continent in being a progressive, sustainable energy industry, and we will continue to do that.

**Mr. MacIntyre:** Killing communities is not leadership.

This NDP government just cannot get anything right on the electricity file. Today we found out the NDP's radical shift to the capacity market led to a credit downgrade for two Albertan job creators. DBRS has chosen to downgrade both Capital Power and TransAlta to a triple-B credit rating. In their reports they specifically cite NDP changes to wholesale power, coal phase-out, and the climate leadership plan. Why won't the Premier stop meddling in the electricity sector, stop hurting our job creators, and stop hurting Alberta families?

**Ms Notley:** Mr. Speaker, what I will not do is stick my head in the sand and pretend that there is no problem when there is one. When we were elected, the electricity system was in the process of melting down. The only way to fix it would have been to allow price volatility to increase by 1,000 per cent. That would have been bad for industry, investors, coal companies, consumers, seniors' homes, food banks, everybody. We said no. We stood up for Albertans. We did the right thing.

**The Speaker:** Hon. members, did you know that today is Deep Dish Pizza Day?

The leader of the third party.

### AIMCo Governance

**Mr. McIver:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. AIMCo looks after \$90 billion, including many Albertans' pension funds. This is a sacred trust to guarantee the retirement of thousands of hard-working civil servants who have built Alberta over decades. At the heritage fund

meeting AIMCo president, Mr. Uebelein, in response to removal of sections 5 and 6 said, "We respectfully disagree that this is an improvement in our governance" and: we think our governance structure is good. He didn't like the changes. To the Premier: will you take that expert advice and reverse these changes in order to protect the retirement nest egg of thousands of Albertans?

**The Speaker:** The hon. Finance minister.

**Mr. Ceci:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. You know, on this side of the House we absolutely have great confidence in the professionals at AIMCo and respect their independence each and every day. The opposition is misleading Albertans, however.

**An Hon. Member:** Point of order.

**The Speaker:** Point of order noted.

**Mr. Ceci:** You know, pension plans set out their own broad parameters around the investments they want to occur, and AIMCo carries those things out. The CEO of AIMCo has said that he's assured members of this House repeatedly that there's no involvement with their independence. Their independence is intact. What else does the CEO need to do, to say to the opposition?

**The Speaker:** Thank you, hon. minister.  
First supplemental.

**Mr. McIver:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. The board of AIMCo will require seven new members in the very near future. These will be the first appointed since the changes in regulation removing the requirement that appointees have in-depth financial knowledge. To the Premier. You stated in this House yesterday that the final decisions on board appointments will be made by cabinet. Can you assure this House and thousands of civil servants whose pensions are tied up in what they look after that the new appointees will have the strongest possible financial business acumen to ensure that their pension investment is not compromised?

**The Speaker:** The hon. Minister of Finance.

**Mr. Ceci:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. You know, I'm getting, I hope, better at answering this question. It's been posed to me many times. The openness and transparencies of ABCs is critically important. All Albertans need to have the opportunity to put their names forward for important ABCs. Only those that have the best credentials for boards like AIMCo will get appointed to those. We have appointed two people, Ken Kroner and Phyllis Clark, with exceptional credentials. They are on the board. I met with the CEO and the chair yesterday, talked about appointments, and they will be coming forward shortly.

**Mr. McIver:** Those appointments were before the regulations changed, Mr. Speaker.

The Finance minister has been asked repeatedly if he would commit to attending the next committee meeting of the heritage savings trust fund to explain the removal of sections 5 and 6. Even the NDP Party committee chair said: "We could direct an invitation. Absolutely." I will table those quotes today. To the Premier. Since your minister has refused over and over again to confirm his willingness to attend for us, will you at least direct your minister to attend for the NDP members who have also expressed a desire to hear from the minister?

**The Speaker:** The Minister of Finance.

**Mr. Ceci:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. You know, I've answered the same question nine times in this House. I want to say that the changes to the openness and transparency for the appointment process are in the best interest of not only AIMCo but of every agency, board, and commission. We have got good people on that board. We are bringing forward and cabinet will approve new appointments to that board soon, and they will have all the board they need.

**The Speaker:** The hon. Member for Calgary-Mountain View.

#### School Fees in Charter Schools

**Dr. Swann:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. When Bill 1 was announced, a government news release said, "Alberta parents will no longer have to pay school fees for instructional supplies or materials." As it turns out, this doesn't mean all parents. Rather, to borrow an Orwellian phrase, some parents are more equal than others. In particular, parents who have students in charter schools aren't getting a break on school fees. This is wrong since charter schools operate entirely within the public education system. Their parents should be entitled to the same school fee reductions. To the minister: why is the Minister of Education discriminating against charter school parents?

**The Speaker:** The Minister of Education.

**Mr. Eggen:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Certainly, by reducing school fees in An Act to Reduce School Fees, we're not eliminating them, but we are making important inroads to reduce school fees across the province. We had to make choices around elimination of different fees in different places. It was very difficult to find the money to in fact do this, you know, but it's worth it because we are putting money back into the pockets of parents when they need it the most. For the 61 school boards here in the province of Alberta that are publicly funded, that is exactly what we are doing.

**Dr. Swann:** Well, Mr. Speaker, according to the government's Charter Schools Handbook, "A charter school is a public school that provides a basic education in a different . . . way." In fact, many charter schools serve marginalized, low-income, and special-needs students. The Association of Public Charter Schools is quite concerned by the decision to exclude them since they are full-fledged members of the public school community. End quote. However, the NDP didn't create charter schools, so perhaps they view them differently. To the minister: does the minister still consider charter schools public? Yes or no?

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

**Mr. Eggen:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Charter schools are what they are. They are charter schools. The funding for the reduction of school fees, again, was not in its complete form but that, rather, we are looking to reduce school fees over time. So that is exactly what we are doing. I am very proud of the moves that we have made to reduce school fees, and I think that many Alberta families would concur.

**Dr. Swann:** Curious, Mr. Speaker, that the criterion was whether they were public or charter, so called, when it's socioeconomic status that would most benefit families. It's quite clear that the NDP government is singling out charter schools for different treatment, one that is more in line with private schools. That's certainly what Public Interest Alberta advocates in their recent media release that urged the government also "to phase out the public funding of private schools . . . and reallocate the money to fulfill its education-related campaign promises." Interestingly, this is exactly the scenario that

Bill 1 sets up. If the minister is planning to defund charter schools, why isn't he telling the Legislature?

**Mr. Eggen:** Well, Mr. Speaker, certainly, we are putting in money for enrolment and we've increased the enrolment funding for all schools, including charter schools and private schools, too. That is the bulk of where schools actually function. I made a choice – we all did – around reducing school fees for schools here in the province of Alberta. We have done so. I think it's a very proud decision to make to reduce school fees. It will put money back into the pockets of Alberta families and make life easier for Albertans.

**The Speaker:** The hon. Member for Calgary-Klein.

#### Carbon Levy and Energy Efficiency Programs

**Mr. Coolahan:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Since the climate leadership plan was announced, one of the main questions I receive from my constituents is around the purpose of the carbon levy. The government projected that the levy would garner \$9.6 billion in total over the levy's first five years. To the Minister of Environment and Parks: how are the funds from the new carbon levy being used?

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

**Ms Phillips:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Of course, two-thirds of Albertans have received a rebate or will over the course of this year to ensure there is no unfair burden to household budgets. Small businesses will see a 33 per cent tax reduction to offset additional costs. That's a tax reduction on small businesses that was not supported by either right-wing party in this House. The carbon levy will also fund energy efficiency programs that will help Albertans lower their emissions, that will help ensure affordability of their bills. That makes life better for everyone even as it creates jobs.

Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

**The Speaker:** First supplemental.

2:10

**Mr. Coolahan:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Given the various incentives and programs announced by the government, to the same minister: how will Albertans benefit from efficiency programs? [interjections]

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister. [interjections]  
Quiet.

**Ms Phillips:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Of course, the previous government left Alberta as the only jurisdiction in North America without an energy efficiency program. For example, in our first phase of residential direct install the average family will save \$112 per year. Up to 70 Albertans have already been hired to do this work. Those are good jobs that we're ensuring are reinvesting the carbon levy right back into our communities. We'll have more programs to announce in the coming weeks and months that will save families more money.

You know, it's very confusing to me that the other parties would pick . . .

**The Speaker:** Thank you, hon. minister.  
Second supplemental.

**Mr. Coolahan:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. To the same minister: how will the carbon levy grow the economy in this province and get us off the resource roller coaster?

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

**Ms Phillips:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Of course, the climate leadership plan led to the approval of two pipelines. Trans Mountain will create 22,000 construction jobs and raise the price of oil. [interjections]

**The Speaker:** Stop the clock, please. Could we keep the volume down?

**Mr. Fildebrandt:** Point of order.

**The Speaker:** Point of order noted.  
Keep the volume down.  
Start the clock.

**Ms Phillips:** Of course, the pipeline approval for Trans Mountain will create 22,000 jobs. It will raise the price of oil by \$3 per barrel.

Now, Mr. Speaker, the members opposite in both parties, the Leader of the Official Opposition and his new frenemy over there in the PCs, are looking for a made-in-Ottawa solution. I guess their time in Ottawa makes them feel like a plan imposed on us from the east would make better sense. We know that that's not what's good for Alberta families.

**The Speaker:** The hon. Member for Calgary-Greenway. [interjections] Calgary-Foothills.

**Mr. Gill:** Oh, my friend. Sorry; we kind of look the same. [interjections]

**The Speaker:** Quiet. It was my error. Quiet, please.  
Hon. member, proceed.

#### Oil Sands Emissions Cap

**Mr. Panda:** When the Premier announced her 100-megatonne cap on oil sands development, she was flanked by four major oil companies. Three of them are now buying up the rest of the oil sands operations. Foreign investors, including Shell, who once endorsed her plan, are waving good-bye to Alberta. Now that the big three control the market within the 100-megatonne cap, there is no room for new players. Can the Premier confirm or deny the market rumour that the big three got a sweetheart deal and will be the only ones who will be permitted to grow under the cap?

**The Speaker:** Thank you, hon. member.

**Ms Phillips:** Well, certainly, Mr. Speaker, the announcement of the climate leadership plan was supported by the oil sands industry and continues to be. I look forward in the supplementals to the members opposite detailing all the ways in which all of our biggest job creators in this province are doing their business wrong. I look forward to them detailing that in the supplementals, dragging their corporate reputations through the mud once again, and I look forward to hearing how they're going to talk Alberta down and hope that we do not succeed in this province. On this side of the House we're putting in place a system whereby our energy industry succeeds and is strong.

**Mr. Panda:** Given that during Bill 25 Wildrose predicted the cap would cause M and A in the oil sands and that support services jobs like HR and IT would be laid off and given that due to this government's misguided policies, companies are taking their business and moving to investment-friendly regimes like Saskatchewan and Texas, can the Premier explain to all the unemployed Calgarians why putting forward job-killing policies is the right thing to do?

**The Speaker:** The hon. Minister of Environment and Parks.

**Ms Phillips:** Well, thank you, Mr. Speaker. I look forward once again to our right-wing friends over here detailing how Athabasca Oil, CNRL, Cenovus are conducting their business wrong, how they are, in fact, not right in how they are moving forward with making our energy industry strong. The Wildrose opposition should be cheering for these Canadian companies, who have expanded their operations in the oil sands not just with existing assets but with future development assets. Instead, they are talking down Alberta every chance they get, they're not supporting our energy industry, and they're slamming the door on the renewables. It's shameful.

**Mr. Panda:** Mr. Speaker, given that all the leases snatched by the big three will not be developed because of the risky policies of this government and given that the Crown sold off these leases for the benefit of royalties and jobs, which are now gone, knowing that the resources will not be developed in any timely manner, is the Premier now going to force the oil sands leaseholders to put their undeveloped leases back on the open market for sale, or will the Crown be forced to buy them back, and at what price?

**Ms Phillips:** Well, certainly, Mr. Speaker, I'm not surprised anymore. This is a side of the House that denies the science of climate change, that doesn't want to support our energy industry to take on the greatest challenge of our time. This is a side . . .

**Mr. Panda:** Point of order.

**The Speaker:** Could you please continue, hon. minister.

**Ms Phillips:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Of course, this is a side of the House that provides direct funds to films that call into question the science of climate change, propagandist films essentially. This is also a side of the House that disputes what people like the CEO of Canada's Oil Sands Innovation Alliance have said, who have praised moving forward with innovation and technology, saying that they are confident . . .

**The Speaker:** Thank you, hon. minister.  
The hon. Member for Calgary-Greenway.

#### Calgary LRT Green Line Funding

**Mr. Gill:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. On December 6 I asked the minister about funding for Calgary's green line LRT, and I was told to go back to school. Well, I did go back to school and found out that in this year's budget there is still no provincial money for this project while the city and the federal government are both committing \$1.53 billion each. To the minister: when will the province come onboard with its one-third share of the funding? Or do I need to go back to school again?

**The Speaker:** The Minister of Infrastructure.

**Mr. Mason:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Our government is very committed to supporting LRT development in both Edmonton and Calgary, unlike the opposition, that would cut billions of dollars out of the capital program of our government and make it unaffordable to support these LRT projects to go ahead with them. I've said all along – and we've supported with millions of dollars for planning for that line – that when that design is finalized and we have clear numbers and we get a formal request from the city of Calgary, we will give it very careful consideration.

**Mr. Gill:** It is ready. The city is ready, Minister.

Given that in this year's Budget Address the Finance minister said, "We look forward to working with both the cities of Calgary and Edmonton to further develop their LRT projects" and given that this government is dedicating \$2.2 billion worth of carbon tax revenue to fund green infrastructure projects, especially low-emission public transit, Minister, since you won't commit to the funding, will you at least confirm that the green line LRT is the kind of project that is an ideal candidate for this kind of funding?

**Mr. Mason:** Well, Mr. Speaker, it's really interesting that the opposition doesn't want us to collect anything under the carbon levy, but they want us to commit it to LRT funding. Well, you can't have it both ways. This government is very, very committed to not only making responsible responses to climate change but to supporting our municipalities to build the LRT systems that they have and to support transit and other things that will reduce the carbon footprint of this government and of this province. The people of Alberta support that.

2:20

**The Speaker:** Thank you, hon. minister.

**Mr. Gill:** The carbon tax is killing more revenue than it brings in.

Given that on June 22, 2015, in reply to the Member for Calgary-Hays, the minister said, "When I have a fuller view of the opinions and needs of the city of Calgary, we will be moving forward in due course" and given that Calgary has been hearing the same minister make the same statement for two years now and people are anxious for the jobs that will come with the \$4.6 billion project, to the minister: will it take another two years for you to move forward, which, by the way, is 2019 and, by the way, is election year?

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

**Mr. Mason:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Well, you know, I stand by the previous statements that I've made. I'll remind the member that we announced in December of this past year close to \$150 million to support the development of the green line. He's trying to forget that or wants to make sure that people forget it.

As I've said, when the project is finalized, when we get a formal request . . . [interjections] Mr. Speaker, if I might . . . [interjections]

**The Speaker:** Quiet.

I'll take care of them, hon. member. Please proceed.

**Mr. Mason:** He asks a question, but he doesn't want to hear the answer, Mr. Speaker.

**The Speaker:** Yes, hon. member.

**Mr. Mason:** So if I may . . .

**The Speaker:** I'm going to give you 10 seconds to finish.

**Mr. Mason:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. When the city of Calgary makes a request, we will give it careful consideration. They haven't done that. If the member expects me to respond to him and give him . . .

**The Speaker:** Thank you, hon. member.

#### Workers' Compensation Board

**Mr. van Dijken:** Mr. Speaker, rebates have been issued to employers in past years because of WCB surpluses. WCB policy stipulates refunds to be automatically triggered once the WCB funding ratio exceeds 128 per cent. Preliminary reports peg the fund

at over 131 per cent. This government has been making it harder for businesses to grow and be profitable, especially during this economic downturn, making these rebates all the more important. Minister, will employers indeed be receiving a refund, as in past years, and when can they expect to receive these refunds?

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

**Ms Gray:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. We embarked on a review of the Workers' Compensation Board because it is so important that Albertans feel confident that WCB provides fair compensation as well as meaningful rehabilitation. The WCB manages its own funds and will make decisions of its own mind as to what to do with surpluses or other funds. At this point we are currently working with the WCB to make sure we have a system that works for both employers and workers.

**Mr. van Dijken:** Given that refunds provide an incentive for businesses to maintain safe practices and given that these rebates enable deserving employers with good safety records to focus on growing their businesses, creating jobs and investing in new and safer equipment, and given that the new board members of the WCB have now been appointed and given that the WCB already receives more than adequate funding to carry out its mandate, will the minister let us know if there are any possible justifications for the WCB to withhold refunds, and if so, what are they?

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

**Ms Gray:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. We are currently undergoing a review of the WCB so that we can ensure that there is adequate funding, to ensure that we are providing adequate services, to make sure that it is fiscally sustainable because the system had not been reviewed in over 15 years. That was irresponsible. We need to make sure that we have a system that is operating for workers and employers, and that review is currently ongoing.

**Mr. van Dijken:** Given that the Labour minister announced the review of the Workers' Compensation Board in March 2016 and given that this review examines WCB practices and policies and given that job creators in this province are hearing rumours that the WCB will be increasing premiums despite operating with massive surpluses, will the minister please tell us when the WCB review panel will publish its report, and what is she hearing? Are there any intentions of increasing WCB premiums? Yes or no?

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

**Ms Gray:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. Because it had been over 15 years since the last review, we appointed a three-person panel to take a serious look at the Workers' Compensation Board system. They have been meeting to review all aspects of workers' compensation policy, funding, et cetera. They are submitting their report to me in spring of this year. I'm looking forward to their recommendations. I do not yet know what their recommendations will be finalized as and therefore cannot speculate, but I do know that I'm looking forward to reviewing those recommendations.

#### Police Services Funding

**Mrs. Pitt:** Mr. Speaker, crime is on the rise, and Albertans are worried about their homes, their businesses, and their families. They want assurances that when they call 911, the police will be there. Despite these facts the NDP's budget made no increase to municipal policing. Even worse, the minister told us that she has

not even factored in the new carbon tax. Instead, she told police departments to apply for green efficiency grants. This government is scrimping on police funding. To the minister: are you suggesting a P3 approach, also known as a provincial Prius police force?

**The Speaker:** The hon. Minister of Justice and Solicitor General.

**Ms Ganley:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. As I told the member yesterday and will be happy to tell her again, this province provides over half a billion dollars in police funding. We transfer more money to municipalities to support policing than any of our western neighbours. We are incredibly glad that we didn't have to make the deep cuts called for over there that would have slashed that funding. [interjections]

**The Speaker:** Quiet.

**Mrs. Pitt:** Mr. Speaker, given that money spent on law enforcement should be directed straight to the front-line police officers and given that the government is going to provide millions of dollars solely for the purpose of making police officers and their mode of transportation more efficient, to the minister: is your intention to increase the cavalry? Where will the horses live?

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

**Ms Ganley:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. As I said in my previous answer, this province continues to provide over half a billion dollars in police funding. When the Conservatives in Ottawa, those guys' BFFs, cut the funding for ALERT, this government stepped in and provided that funding.

**The Speaker:** Second supplemental.

**Mrs. Pitt:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Considering that the minister hasn't done the math on their risky ideological carbon tax on everything and given that the biggest cost for police is actually the salaries paid to front-line staff and police officers and since the Premier told Albertans to deal with the carbon tax by taking a bus, is the minister expecting municipalities to pick up the tab for the obvious shortfalls, or can our men and women in blue expect bus passes for policing our communities?

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

**Ms Ganley:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. As I've said before, we will continue to . . . [interjections]

**The Speaker:** Quiet down.

**Ms Ganley:** . . . provide over half a billion dollars to police in funding. That is something that would not have been possible under the opposition's plan to slash 10 per cent from my budget. That would have impacted the front lines directly. You know, we will continue to fund. They want to slash and burn. [interjections]

**The Speaker:** Hon. members.

The hon. Member for Calgary-Lougheed.

### Support for Persons Affected by Violent Crimes

**Mr. Rodney:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Tragically, on April 15, 2014, Kaiti Perras, Lawrence Hong, Jordan Segura, Josh Hunter, and Zackariah Rathwell were murdered by Matthew de Groot in the worst homicide in Calgary's history. Because Mr. de Groot was classified as not criminally responsible, a mental health review is convened periodically to assess him, and I know that the families

of the victims intend to attend all of these panels on a go-forward basis. To the Minister of Justice. With great respect, these families are continually reliving this horrific incident. Have you met with them in person, and if so, what supports have you offered?

**The Speaker:** Thank you, hon. member.

The hon. minister.

2:30

**Ms Ganley:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker and to the member for a very important question. Of course, all families of victims of homicide are incredibly affected by the experience. That's why I've taken so much time to meet with victim support advocates, to meet with a support group for the families of murdered individuals. We know that this is a tragic and difficult circumstance for these people, and that's why we're moving forward with a review of victims of crime funding, to see what additional supports we can provide.

**The Speaker:** Thank you, hon. member.

**Mr. Rodney:** Given that this horrific crime continues to have an impact on Calgary at large but, more specifically, on those who knew the victims as well as all of those who attended postsecondary institutions which the victims were studying at when they were murdered and given that the rights of the victims should always come first, again to the minister: what specific supports has your government put in place to assist with suffering and loss, which numerous Albertans continue to experience because of this horrible crime?

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

**Ms Ganley:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker and to the member for the important question. The government provides an enormous amount of programming through the victims of crime fund that people have access to in order to seek the supports that they need. That victims of crime fund, as people will be well aware, has been reviewed by the Auditor General because of the increasing surplus over the last decade. We are moving forward to ensure that we're doing a gaps analysis, and we're moving forward to make sure that that money gets to where it's intended, to make sure that victims of crime are properly supported.

**Mr. Rodney:** Families and friends would love to see specifics.

Now, given that this case was presided over by a Court of Queen's Bench justice and is therefore a matter which is within the purview of a federal Minister of Justice and given that the structure of the mental health review panel means that families and friends of the victims must continually relive this tragic incident, something none of us want to see, again to the minister: have you contacted your federal counterpart about this case to advocate on behalf of the victims, families, and friends in order to reduce their suffering in every way possible?

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

**Ms Ganley:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. As the member will no doubt be aware, the government of Canada is looking at several fronts in terms of reviewing Criminal Code processes. They have acknowledged that this is a shared responsibility between the federal government and the provincial governments, which is great news because the previous government wouldn't do it. Moving forward, we have been having conversations about how to streamline this process and make it easier for everyone, including victims of crime as well as the public.

**The Speaker:** The hon. Member for Edmonton-South West.

### Hospitals in Edmonton

**Mr. Dang:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Given that my constituents and all Albertans deserve the best for their health care and given that the previous government ignored Edmonton's hospital infrastructure for decades, to the Minister of Health: what is this government doing to deliver quality health care to Albertans in Edmonton?

**The Speaker:** The hon. Minister of Health.

**Ms Hoffman:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker and to the member for the important question. For decades Edmontonians saw the previous government ignore their needs when it came to ensuring that their hospitals were maintained and that new growth was addressed. That has come to an end. This government is working to make life better for Albertans living in the city of Edmonton and those who rely on the resources here by announcing a new hospital for the city of Edmonton, work at the Misericordia hospital for the emergency, and important investments at the Royal Alex as well, and I'm so proud to do that.

**The Speaker:** First supplemental.

**Mr. Dang:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker, and thank you to the minister. Given that the quality of care in our hospitals is directly related to maintaining staffing in our hospitals and health care centres, to the same minister: what is the government doing to ensure we have sufficient staffing in all facilities?

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

**Ms Hoffman:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. One of our very first actions as a government was to reverse the reckless cuts that were proposed by the outgoing government. We are so proud to have the lines of men and women who work on the front lines to support our health care system and the families who require those important public services. The last thing Albertans need during a difficult economic downturn is to worry about whether or not a hospital is going to be in their neighbourhood when they have a case of emergency. We're proud to support the public and the public health care system in the province of Alberta.

**The Speaker:** Second supplemental.

**Mr. Dang:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Given that Budget 2017 announced \$400 million for a new hospital in the Edmonton region, my constituents want to know: where will this hospital be, and what else can the minister tell us about these plans?

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

**Ms Hoffman:** Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. I know the member's riding is full of new houses and young families that are in desperate need of expanded health care services throughout our city of Edmonton and in other parts of the city as well. We're continuing to consider a number of options for the new site, but I have to say that I'm so proud that after waiting decades – the last new hospital for the city of Edmonton was built in the 1980s. The children in the gallery probably can't even imagine what life was like in the '80s. But guess what? In the future their lives are going to be better because this

government is working hard to make sure that we're making their lives better.

**The Speaker:** The hon. Member for Grande Prairie-Smoky.

### Coal Strategy

**Mr. Loewen:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. In the Environment and Parks business plan on page 66 under Key Strategies it says that the government is "phasing out emissions from coal-fired sources of electricity." That clearly says "phasing out emissions," not phasing out coal. To the minister: do you agree with that statement from your business plan? Yes or no?

**The Speaker:** The minister of environment.

**Ms Phillips:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. It's very clear that we are phasing out emissions from coal-fired electricity and working with the incumbent generators and the post-2030 plants. We are working with the federal government as well to ensure that if the companies decide to do a conversion, the regulatory environment is there to support that decision and a number of other initiatives. You know, the folks opposite would prefer that we spend \$10 billion, at a minimum – \$10 billion, at a minimum – to invest in risky and unproven CCS technology. That is not an . . .

**The Speaker:** Thank you, hon. minister.

**Mr. Loewen:** Yeah, \$10 billion sounds like the deficit for each of the last two years.

Given that metallurgical coal is used to make iron and steel and that Alberta is home to an immense deposit of high-quality, low-sulphur metallurgical coal and given that the government talks a lot about diversifying the economy and that metallurgical coal has the potential to do just that as it is exported, to the minister: is it your department's plan to phase out metallurgical coal or to stop any new metallurgical coal projects?

**The Speaker:** The minister of environment.

**Ms Phillips:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. The answer is no. [interjections]

**The Speaker:** Quiet.

**Mr. Loewen:** Well, finally an answer after hundreds of questions.

If science shows that coal can be burned as clean as other alternatives like natural gas, biomass, et cetera, will you still pursue the complete elimination of coal-fired power?

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

**Ms Phillips:** Well, thank you, Mr. Speaker. Of course, there's a difference between metallurgical coal and thermal coal, which is why I answered no to that previous question.

Now, it is true that there are some unproven technologies out there and some proven technologies that are extremely expensive, which, I suppose, is why our friends across the way would prefer that we spend \$10 billion on phasing out coal emissions in order to improve Albertans' health and so on. That is not our approach. We are going to ensure that we are helping the generators of those post-2030 plants transition accordingly, Mr. Speaker. We're going to make sure that we create jobs . . .

**The Speaker:** Thank you, hon. minister.  
Grande Prairie-Wapiti.

### Fertilizer Management

**Mr. Drysdale:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Effective fertilizer management does not only safeguard the environment but also protects farm productivity. Research is being done through funding by the Alberta Crop Industry Development Fund to look at crop rotation and fertilizer programs to reduce the production of nitrous oxide. Fertilizer management educated by this kind of research can greatly reduce emissions per bushel of crop. To the minister of agriculture: what program is your government offering farmers to adapt their management practices to reduce intensity of emissions?

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

**Mr. Carlier:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker and to the member for the question. I think, first off, we have to recognize the farmers and producers out there for the great work they are doing. The innovation often comes from the industry itself around varied application of not only fertilizers but other chemicals as well, that are seeing improvement and continued improvement in the farming industry right across Alberta, technology that's even exported around the world. I'm proud of our producers and farmers in this province for the innovation work that they are doing.

Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

**The Speaker:** First supplemental.

**Mr. Drysdale:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Given that farmers are seeking ways to maximize nitrogen uptake by their crops and given that this helps them ensure that they will get high yields and makes sure there is not excessive available nitrogen not taken up by the crops, to the minister: how are you collecting definitive data for farmers about new fertilizers so they can use it and ensure that these new technologies will work for their practices?

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

2:40

**Mr. Carlier:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. In the previous answer I talked about the good work farmers are doing. I also want to talk about the good work that our researchers, both federally and provincially, are doing around this. We have two centres in Alberta, the Crop Diversification Centre North and the Crop Diversification Centre South, that are continuously doing work around fertilizers and crops, new and even emerging crops around that fertilizer, applications of it, the development of new ones, et cetera. I'm very proud of the work that our public servants are doing to help. They can do what we are doing, and that makes life better for all Albertans.

**The Speaker:** Second supplemental.

**Mr. Drysdale:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Given that an Alberta Crop Industry Development Fund study done on fertilizer technology and management led to the creation of the Alberta farm fertilizer information and recommendation manager, or AFFIRM, and given that this online tool helps producers apply the right amount of fertilizer while maximizing their yields and profits, to the minister: what are you doing to make more tools like AFFIRM available for farmers to be the best environmental stewards of their land?

**The Speaker:** The hon. minister.

**Mr. Carlier:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker and to the member. The member has also acknowledged that good stewardship that the

farmers are already doing, and he mentioned the manual, that it's not a static manual. Everything should be changing. As all technology changes, so does technology on farms change. There are some extremely interesting things and some very innovative things going out there now. Government will continue to support that innovation through various funding, both through Agriculture and Forestry and Economic Development and Trade, as we go forward in that great, wide, new frontier that farming is.

Thank you.

**The Speaker:** Members, 30 seconds for those who don't want to stay and enjoy this wonderful experience.

### Members' Statements

(continued)

#### Pipeline Opposition

**Mr. Barnes:** Mr. Speaker, the Manitoba NDP just passed a new party resolution called – surprise, surprise – Keep It in the Ground. The resolution opposes “the expansion and development of any new pipelines to transport tar sands oil through Manitoba.” This puts them squarely onside with their comrades in B.C. who oppose pipelines like Kinder Morgan. This evokes memories of when the federal NDP held a convention right here in Alberta and voted for the Leap Manifesto, the most radical anti-oil, anti-Alberta doctrine ever put forward in Canadian politics.

We all know the NDP is one big party. There is no B.C. NDP or Manitoba NDP; there is just the NDP. For some reason, however, the members opposite think they're different than their comrades in B.C. and Manitoba. My guess is that they're not basing that assessment on the Premier's hand-picking energy advisers at the oil sands advisory group. After all, Tzeporah Berman calls our oil sands the tar sands, and she compared Fort McMurray to Mordor.

Then we have Karen Mahon. She's campaigned against Kinder Morgan, but she's taking her activism to the next level. As the director of ForestEthics, Mahon is raising money to stop this project. In a letter dated March 26 she urged members to bog the pipeline down in lawsuits and kill it and the thousands of jobs it would have provided. She even moderated a panel last week on how – and I quote from her e-mail – resistance can stop pipelines. After the panel she released a how-to video on protesting and destroying pipelines. Mr. Speaker, an action a day.

The fact that decent, hard-working Albertans are subsidizing Mahon's activities is a disgrace, and this government should be ashamed. The Premier has had many opportunities to do the right thing and show Mahon the door, but she just laughs and shrugs it off. Albertans know this NDP government is working behind the scenes to stop . . .

**The Speaker:** Thank you, hon. member.

Order. Excuse me. I've already said it once. Order, please.

### Tabling Returns and Reports

**The Speaker:** Calgary-Hays.

**Mr. McIver:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. In my question today I said that I would table the evidence of the NDP member asking for the minister to come to speak at the next committee meeting, and true to my word, I hope, that's what I'm doing.

**The Speaker:** The Member for Strathmore-Brooks.

**Mr. Fildebrandt:** Yes, Mr. Speaker. I'm pleased to rise on day 8 of fantastic Public Affairs Bureau tablings. I'm tabling a letter that I wrote on the 9th of March to the hon. Government House Leader. The title of the letter is "On March 21st 2013 [you] said." I have the five requisite copies.

**The Speaker:** The Member for Calgary-Mountain View.

**Dr. Swann:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I'm pleased to table the appropriate number of copies of a news release from Public Interest Alberta from February 23 that I mentioned in my question, which urges the government to eliminate private school funding to pay for NDP election promises. I'll table a backgrounder also on private and charter schools from Public Interest Alberta, in which they say: charter schools "are really just private schools that are subsidized by taxpayers." They give reasons for eliminating their funding as well.

Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

### Tablings to the Clerk

**The Clerk:** I wish to advise the Assembly that the following document were deposited with the office of the Clerk: on behalf of the hon. Mr. S. Anderson, Minister of Municipal Affairs, pursuant to the Government Organization Act the Alberta Boilers Safety Association annual report 2016.

On behalf of the hon. Ms McLean, Minister of Service Alberta and Minister of Status of Women, a letter dated March 30, 2017, from Jill Clayton, Information and Privacy Commissioner, to Marcia Nelson, Deputy Minister of Executive Council, regarding investigation reports.

### Point of Order Parliamentary Language

**The Speaker:** The hon. Member for Calgary-Hays.

**Mr. McIver:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I hope that you can understand that I don't have the Blues in front of me, but the hon. Finance minister used the word "misleading." Without going into too much detail, I will cite *Beauchesne's*, sixth edition, under section 489, where it's labelled as an unparliamentary word, and also on page 148 in section 490 it's an unparliamentary word. I think it's pretty obvious based on that alone that the hon. minister should apologize and withdraw those remarks.

I must say, Mr. Speaker, that it's particularly egregious since you warned about this just yesterday and the hon. Government House Leader had to withdraw a similar remark from the Premier just yesterday, yet he hasn't instructed his people to live up to your ruling.

**The Speaker:** The hon. Government House Leader.

**Mr. Mason:** Well, thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. It's interesting to me that the hon. Member for Calgary-Hays knows what I have and have not instructed my caucus to do.

It's clear as well, Mr. Speaker, that the hon. member was not really paying attention to the nuances of the ruling because in this particular case the reference was not to an individual member of the Assembly but to the opposition. I remember quite clearly that he talked about: the opposition is misleading. My recollection of the rulings that you've made and other Speakers have made make quite a distinction between accusing a specific member of misleading or, on the other hand, accusing the government or the opposition, in this case, of misleading.

It's pretty clear that there is a difference of opinion with respect to the facts. The hon. minister was suggesting that the opposition is attempting to mislead the public, something with which I concur. All you have to do is take a look at the various statements that they have made with respect to this and other issues to realize that what they're trying to get the public to believe and what the facts are are two quite different things in many cases.

With respect, Mr. Speaker, I don't believe that there is a point of order here.

2:50

**The Speaker:** The Official Opposition House Leader.

I wonder if he'd turn his chair around.

Thank you.

Let me be clear on what the Blues do say. "The opposition is misleading Albertans, however." That was the sentence. The point that the Government House Leader made is correct. It is always context in which one interprets the use of the words. In the instance yesterday there was a specific member that was identified and a specific phrase, in fact reinforced twice. That matter was withdrawn. In this instance it was to a general – so technically I don't believe it was a point of order.

However, how many times do you want to use the words "misleading," "context," "untrue," et cetera? It just, you know . . . [interjections] Hon. members, please don't interrupt when I'm speaking. Try and decide as a group amongst yourselves if this is productive use of time in this place. I'm sure you can go on and on forever about this, but you've heard me talk so many times about this, so I guess you have to share responsibility along with me. So not technically a point of order, but I would ask that all of the members be conscious of the way in which you use the words.

Second point, the Opposition House Leader, I think.

### Point of Order Language Creating Disorder

**Mr. Cooper:** Well, thank you, Mr. Speaker. It's a pleasure to rise to this point of order and speak directly to comments that were made by the Minister of Education when he used abusive or insulting language of a nature likely to create disorder, which, for those following along at home, is Standing Order 23(j). While I am certain that the comments that the Minister of Education made will not be recorded in the Blues as they certainly . . .

**The Speaker:** Hon. member, if I can just clarify the process: are you speaking to a point of order that might have been initially raised by the Member for Strathmore-Brooks?

**Mr. Cooper:** That's correct.

**Mr. Mason:** Can you say what time it was?

**Mr. Cooper:** Yeah. I'm getting there.

I'll be the first to admit that from time to time the temperature rises in the Chamber. Mr. Speaker, you will know that this is not a classroom, nor should it be one. This is a place where we battle for ideas that are important to Albertans. So from time to time the ire will get raised. While the minister may think the opposition are idiots, it would be wildly inappropriate of him to use that language in this Chamber. The minister certainly will know that that is what he said although it may not appear in *Hansard*, and I'm certain that it's not in the Blues. He knows, and he should withdraw and apologize for the language that he used.

**The Speaker:** Government House Leader, any comments?



**Mr. Mason:** Well, thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. You know, I recognize that question period brings out all kinds of aspects of people's personalities and so on which may appear to people on the other side as strange or different or otherwise, you know, unexplainable. That probably goes on both sides. I think that maybe the minister had some of those thoughts about the activities of the Member for Calgary-Greenway when I was trying to answer his questions. I think he was rather excited. However, I don't think that his behaviour deserved to be called, as has been suggested, idiotic.

I know that the Official Opposition House Leader doesn't really expect people to admit to their errors, but I did receive a note from the Minister of Education, who had to be at another important meeting. He said: I think the Wildrose might have called a point of order on me when I called the Calgary-Greenway member an idiot; I'm sorry. On behalf of the Minister of Education, Mr. Speaker, I am authorized to offer an apology, and I do so and withdraw the comments. Calgary-Greenway is not an idiot.

**The Speaker:** It's withdrawn. I just wish that the temperature would stay at this level rather than the other levels it gets to.

Thank you to the member.

Opposition House Leader, I think we have point of order 3. Is that correct?

#### **Point of Order Language Creating Disorder**

**Mr. Cooper:** Yeah. On behalf of my colleague from Calgary-Foothills, again, language that's likely to create disorder. On numerous occasions inside this Chamber my hon. colleague from Calgary-Foothills, who is a very respected engineer outside of this place and is a passionate believer in science and is certainly not a climate change denier – during his question the minister of the environment made accusations about being a climate change denier. I know, Mr. Speaker, that you've spoken at length about the context. I know that you have specifically warned the minister of the environment about making such allegations directed towards the Member for Calgary-Foothills. I would suggest that it would be helpful for decorum in this House if she would refrain from using that language, making those allegations, just as you have also suggested, sir.

**The Speaker:** The Government House Leader.

**Mr. Mason:** Well, thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. Well, I did listen carefully to the exchange. You know, contrary to the previous rule about not naming a specific member and it not being an offence to talk about a group, government or opposition, as misleading – I think that this is kind of the opposite, where the minister was actually talking about specific members on the other side.

Now, the Wildrose has been at great pains to stand up and say: you can't call us as a group climate change deniers. What they really mean is: well, Mr. Speaker, you can't do that because some of us are not. However, the opposite of that is that some of them are, and in this particular case the minister was referring, I think,

specifically to the Member for Cypress-Medicine Hat's actions in funding a film or a video that denies climate change. On that basis she was referring, not using the term "climate change deniers," to some members on the opposite side who deny the science of climate change. As I recall, those were the words that she used. It's pretty evident that that's true. It ought not cause disorder.

I recognize that Calgary-Foothills has been at great pains to stand up and to clarify his position that he, unlike some of his colleagues, does not deny the science of climate change. I accept that. I believe clearly that that member has a scientific approach to this issue and is not a denier of human-caused climate change, as most of the scientists in the world and most serious and responsible political . . . [interjections] You see there, Mr. Speaker? They're arguing that most scientists in the world do not believe in human – so it's just evidence that, you know, if you just toss out a few little fish, there are going to be some dolphins that are going to jump out of the water, and they just can't help themselves.

3:00

It's pretty clear that there's a good bunch over there that, you know, have serious doubts about the scientific consensus about the impact on the planet, but that doesn't mean all of them do. In that respect I acknowledge that the Member for Calgary-Foothills does not deny the science of climate change, but others may do that. The minister was stating that, and I think that she was on very solid ground in doing so, so I do not believe that there is a point of order.

**The Speaker:** Well, what was said, which I believe was the matter on point, was: "This is a side of the House that denies the science of climate change, that doesn't want to support our energy industry to take on the greatest challenge of our time." That was the word. It is not in other situations technically a point of order.

Again to the same point, I'm not sure if it resonates with this Assembly or not, but how many times can we ask that members stay away from words like "misleading," "climate change"? That phrase has caused . . . [interjections] When do you want to change the place, folks? It's up to you. Do you want to discuss . . . [interjection] Please. Enough points of order. Excuse me. It's so much on my mind that it sticks with me.

Hon. members, the daily Routine is now concluded. Pursuant to Standing Order 59.01(5)(b) the House stands adjourned until tomorrow afternoon at 1:30.

The legislative policy committees will convene this afternoon and tomorrow morning for consideration of main estimates. This afternoon Families . . . [interjections] I know you are all very attentive. This afternoon Families and Communities will consider the estimates of Status of Women in the Rocky Mountain Room. Tomorrow morning Families and Communities will consider the estimates for Community and Social Services in the Rocky Mountain Room, and Resource Stewardship will consider the estimates of Transportation in the Parkland Room.

[The Assembly adjourned at 3:03 p.m. pursuant to Standing Order 59.01(5)(b)]



## Table of Contents

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| Prayers .....   | 527 |
| Introduction of Guests .....                          | 527 |
| Members' Statements                                   |     |
| Olds College Gala.....                                | 528 |
| Government Achievements .....                         | 528 |
| Government Policies .....                             | 528 |
| Family and Gender-based Violence.....                 | 529 |
| Samuel W. Shaw Middle School.....                     | 529 |
| Pipeline Opposition .....                             | 537 |
| Oral Question Period                                  |     |
| Labour Legislation Review .....                       | 529 |
| Carbon Levy Costs and Energy Efficiency Programs..... | 530 |
| Electric Power System.....                            | 530 |
| AIMCo Governance .....                                | 531 |
| School Fees in Charter Schools .....                  | 532 |
| Carbon Levy and Energy Efficiency Programs .....      | 532 |
| Oil Sands Emissions Cap.....                          | 533 |
| Calgary LRT Green Line Funding.....                   | 533 |
| Workers' Compensation Board .....                     | 534 |
| Police Services Funding .....                         | 534 |
| Support for Persons Affected by Violent Crimes .....  | 535 |
| Hospitals in Edmonton .....                           | 536 |
| Coal Strategy .....                                   | 536 |
| Fertilizer Management.....                            | 537 |
| Tabling Returns and Reports .....                     | 537 |
| Tablings to the Clerk .....                           | 538 |

*Alberta Hansard* is available online at [www.assembly.ab.ca](http://www.assembly.ab.ca)

For inquiries contact:

Managing Editor

*Alberta Hansard*

3rd Floor, 9820 – 107 St

EDMONTON, AB T5K 1E7

Telephone: 780.427.1875